

ST. MARY'S UNIVERSITY COLLEGE SCHOOL OF GRADUATE STUDIES

IMPACT OF WOMEN ENTREPRENEURSHIP DEVELOPMENT PROJECT LOANS ON THE SOCIO- ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT OF WOMEN ENTREPRENEURS: THE CASE STUDY OF VISION FUND MICRO FINANCE INSTITUTION, ADDIS ABABA BRANCH

BY:

HIRUT ALEBACHEW

January 2020

## ADDIS ABABA, ETHIOPIA

IMPACT OF WOMEN ENTREPRENEURSHIP DEVELOPMENT PROJECT LOANS ON THE SOCIO- ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT OF WOMEN ENTREPRENEURS: THE CASE STUDY OF VISION FUND MICRO FINANCE INSTITUTION, ADDIS ABABA BRANCH

## BY:

HIRUT ALEBACHEW

ID: SGS/0177/2010A

ATHESIS SUBMITTED TO ST. MARY'S UNIVERSITY COLLECGE, SCHOOL OF GRADUATE STUDIES IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION (GENERAL MANAGEMENT CONCENTRATION)

January 2020

ADDIS ABABA, ETHIOPIA

# ST. MARY'S UNIVERSITY COLLEGE <br> SCHOOL OF GRATUATE STUDIES <br> FACULITY OF BUSINESS 

# IMPACT OF WOMEN ENTREPRENEURSHIP DEVELOPMENT PROJECT LOANS ON THE SOCIO- ECONOMIC EVELOPMENT OF WOMEN ENTREPRENEURS: THE CASE STUDY OF VISION FUND MICRO FINANCE INSTITUTION, ADDIS ABABA BRANCH 

## BY:

HIRUT ALEBACHEW

## APPROVED BY BOARD OF EXAMINERS

Dean, Graduate Studies

Advisor

External Examiner

Internal Examiner

Signature

Signature

Signature

Signature

## ENDORSEMENT

This thesis has been submitted to St. Mary's University College, School of
Graduate Studies for examination with my approval as a university advisor.

Advisor
Signature

## DECLARATION

I, the undersigned, declare that this thesis is my original work, prepared under the guidance of
$\qquad$ . All sources of materials used for the thesis have been duly acknowledged. I further confirm that the thesis has not been submitted either in part or in full to any other higher learning institution for the purpose of earning any degree.

Name
Signature

St. Mary's University College, Addis Ababa
December 2019

## Contents

ACKNOWLEDEMENTS ..... viii
Abbreviations ..... ix
List of Table .....  X
List of Figures ..... xi
Abstract. ..... xii
CHAPTER ONE - INTRODUCTION ..... 1
1.1 Background of the Study ..... 1
1.2 Statement of the Problem .....  3
1.3 Research Questions .....  5
1.4 Research Objective .....  6
1.5 Significance of the Study .....  .6
1.6 Scope of the Study .....  7
1.7 Limitation of the Study .....  7
1.8 Organization of the Paper .....  7
CHAPTER TWO - REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE: .....  8
2.1 Introduction .....  8
2.2 Understanding the concept of Socio-economic effects related to poverty .....  8
2.3. Theoretical Review of Entrepreneurship .....  9
2.4. Empirical Review on Women Entrepreneurship ..... 18
2.5. Conceptual Framework ..... 19
CHAPTER THREE - RESEARCH METHODOLOGY ..... 21
3.1 Introduction ..... 21
3.1 Research Design. ..... 21
3.2 Data Sources and Data Collection Method ..... 22
3.3 Population and Sampling ..... 23
3.4 Methods of Data Analysis ..... 26
CHAPTER FOUR- DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION ..... 35
4.1 Institutional Profile and Outreach Performance of Vision Fund Micro Finance Institution, (WEDP) ..... 35
4.2. Descriptions of Characteristics of Sample Clients ..... 39
4.3: Source of loan before taking WEDP loan ..... 43
4.4: The Impact of WEDP loan on Economic welfare of beneficiaries ..... 44
4.5: The impact of WEDP Loan on human capital aspect ..... 48
4.6 : Impacts of WEDP loan program on household and Social level ..... 52
4.7 Types of the business clients are engaged in ..... 60
4.8 Econometric Results ..... 61
4.9 Propensity score ..... 63
CHAPTER FIVE - SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION ..... 67
5.1 SUMMARY ..... 67
5.2 CONCLUSIONS ..... 69
5.3 RECOMMENDATION ..... 71
6. REFERENCE ..... 73
Appendix A-1 ..... i
Appendix A-2 ..... iii
Appendix A-3 ..... v

## ACKNOWLEDEMENTS

First, I would like to express my heart full appreciation to my advisor, Maru Shete (PhD, Ass. Prof)for his unreserved and professional assistance as well as encouragement, constructive comments and continuous follow up given to me from beginning of this thesis up to the end.

I would also like to acknowledge Ato Abiyot Urga Dadi and Ato Derje Alelegn who have contributed to this thesis, I am gratefully indebted for their valuable comments and supports on this thesis. All my friends and family for their encouragement, and all who have contributed to this Paper in one way or the other

Finally, I must express my very profound gratitude to my Husband, Ato Teressa Urgessa, for providing me with unfailing support and continuous encouragement throughout my years of study and through the process of researching and writing this thesis. This accomplishment would not have been possible without him Thank you.

## Abbreviations

SNNPR: Southern Nations Nationalities and Peoples' Region.
VFMFI: Vision Fund Microfinance Institution S.C.
WEDP: Women's Entrepreneurship Development Project.
ATT: Average treatment effect on treated
FGD: Focus Group Discussion
PSM: Propensity score matching
UNDP: United Nations Development Participant
WB: World Bank

## List of Table

Table 1: General characteristics of beneficiaries ..... 39
Table 2. Family size of the WEDP loan beneficiaries ..... 42
Table. 3: Source of loan ..... 43
Table 4: Percentage distribution of the sample by purpose for which loan is used ..... 47
Table 5: Training participation of WEDP beneficiaries ..... 48
Table 6: School enrolment of WEDP beneficiaries' children. ..... 49
Table 7: Responsibility for decisions on Credit ..... 50
Table 8: cash expenditure of the husband ..... 52
Table 9: The value of husband's to Women's contribution ..... 54
Table 10: participation in household decision making ..... 56
Table 11: participation in traditional institutions ..... 57
Table 12: ownership of asset. ..... 58
Table 13: level of self-image of WDEP beneficiaries ..... 59
Table 14: Type business respondents engaged ..... 60
Table 15: Logit results of client's program participation ..... 62
Table 16: Matching Methods to Measure Impact of Microfinance in poverty reeducation. 64

## List of Figures

Figure 1: Occupation Nature of WEDP beneficiaries ..... 43
Figure 2: Income trend of WEDP beneficiaries before and after taking the loan ..... 44
Figure 3: Saving trend of WEDP beneficiaries ..... 46
Figure 4: outcome of training for WEDP beneficiaries ..... 48


#### Abstract

Women are becoming increasingly important in the socio-economic development of both developed and developing economies. Female entrepreneurship represents a vast untapped source of innovation, job creation and economic growth in the developing world. Women's Entrepreneurship Development Project (WEDP) is a $\$ 50$ million IDA investment lending operation designed to address the key constraints for growth-oriented women entrepreneurs in Ethiopia. Its objective is to increase the earnings and employment of micro and small enterprises owned or partly owned by women entrepreneurs in Ethiopia. It targets growth oriented women entrepreneurs, providing credit as well as entrepreneurship training/business development services. The purpose of the study is to investigate the impact of women entrepreneurship development project (WEDP) loans on the socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs in the case study of Vision Fund Micro Finance Institution, Addis Ababa branch. The study was used two groups of samples namely, experimental or treatment group and control group. A total of 220 samples are selected. 100 samples are used as treatment group from the total population size 419 and 120 are used as control group. Documentation, survey IQuestionnaires, Focus Group Discussion (FGD), and Key Informants Interviews was used as a data collecting tools. Descriptive statistics and econometric model were applied for analyzing quantitative data. The contribution of WEDP is analyzed based on income, saving, expenditure for health, expenditure for children school, asset accumulation, decision making power, business management skills along with the strength and weakness of the project. The finding indicates that Vision Fund Microfinance WEDP has made positive contributions to the wellbeing of its client. However, all of Vision Fund Microfinance WEDP clients have already been involved in a business activity that can generate income for the repayment of the loan. The study revealed that the aim of WEDP to reach out the any growth oriented women entrepreneurs has not been achieved due to target problems. It was, again, uncovered that, microfinance try as much as possible to reduce the risk involved in giving out unsecured loans. One of their ways of trying to achieve this is by group lending which automatically sideline the poorest since the groups are formed based on the income level of the individual.


Key words: women entrepreneurship, socio- economic development, WEDP.

## CHAPTER ONE - INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 Background of the Study

Female entrepreneurship represents a vast untapped source of innovation, job creation and economic growth in the developing world. Entrepreneurship generally is vital to the economy of a nation with respect to economic development and socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs' activity. Entrepreneurship offers tremendous opportunities for all and sundry, especially women across the world by opening doors to self-sufficiency, self-esteem, education and growth for themselves, their families and employees (Jalbert, 2010). Women entrepreneurs are simply women that participate in total entrepreneurial activities, who take the risks involved in mobilizing resources together in a unique way so as to take advantage of the opportunity identified in their immediate environment through production of goods and services, (Okafor and Mordi, 2010).

Entrepreneurship as the engine of economic growth and wheel that pedal the vehicle of economic development has been recognized for its importance in the area of job creation, revenue generation, socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs alleviation and wealth creation (Josiane, 2011).Entrepreneurship is important for the support of small and medium enterprises (United Nations, 2016). Entrepreneurship is therefore a process that involves to refresh market offerings, innovate, risks taking, trying out of new and uncertain products, services, markets and being more proactive than competitors towards exploring new business opportunities (Wiklund and Shepherd,2011).

The importance of entrepreneurship to the people in a nation cannot be overemphasized especially, women who have been under appreciated for a long time in developing economies. Women play essential and dynamic roles in economic life, they adapt easily to change and are very creative. As agents of development in all societies women play tremendous roles through creativity and innovations both in the formal and informal sector although, highly prevalent in the informal sector. Women are therefore becoming increasingly important in the socio-economic development of both developed and developing economies as they account for significant percent of the operators of Small and Medium Enterprises (Kjeldsen and Nielson, 2012).

In spite of the enormous importance of the micro, small and medium enterprises (MSME) sector to the national economy with regards to job creation and the alleviation of abject socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs among impoverished women in Ethiopia, the degree of recognition and strategic support provided to the sector is grossly inadequate. Three successive governments that were in power since 1960 have failed to improve the plight of women entrepreneurs in Ethiopia (Ethiopian Welfare Monitoring Unit, 2015).

Over the past decade, Ethiopia has achieved high economic growth, averaging $10.7 \%$ per year, establishing the country among the fastest growing economies both in Africa and the developing world. However, Ethiopia is falling behind its peers in credit to the private sector. At the same time, opportunities for women entrepreneurs in Ethiopia lag far behind those of men (World Bank, 2016) In the Economist's Women's Economic Opportunity index, Ethiopia occupies the 107th rank out of 112 countries. Most growth-oriented women entrepreneurs fall into a 'missing middle' trap, in which they are served neither by commercial banks nor by microfinance institutions. High minimum loan sizes and excessive collateral requirements restrict women's access to loans from commercial banks. Microfinance Institutions (MFIs) primarily cater for micro-firms with group lending schemes that provide very small loans. Growth-oriented women-owned enterprises are therefore starved of the investment they need to thrive.

Women's Entrepreneurship Development Project (WEDP) is a $\$ 50$ million IDA investment lending operation designed to address the key constraints for growth-oriented women entrepreneurs in Ethiopia. DFAID Canada and UK's DFID are key development partners funding part of the project's activities with an additional $\$ 13$ million. The project became effective in October 2012. The objective of Women's Entrepreneurship Development Project (WEDP) is to increase earnings and employment for women-owned enterprises in Ethiopia. It addresses the key constraints for growth-oriented women entrepreneurs in Ethiopia. (World Bank, IBRD,ID report July 21, 2016)

WEDP's line of credit involves a market "up-scaling" operation where the Development Bank of Ethiopia (DBE) acts as a wholesaler and MFIs act as retailers. The project uses an incentive approach aimed at (i) helping DBE developing a new business line involving wholesaling of MSE subsidiary loans and provision of related technical support to participating MFIs; and (ii) helping
the MFIs build up a high quality MSE loan portfolio based on credit techniques that have been developed and validated under successful micro and small loan programs in other countries, introduced through downscaling or up scaling approaches to micro finance. The programmer works with service providers promoting entrepreneurship development (financial, non-financial, public, private, associative, freelance etc.) and builds their capacity to better support women entrepreneurs to start and grow their businesses. It also works towards creating a more positive enabling environment for WED, by supporting assessments of the situation, and working with governments and policy makers to remove the specific gender barriers that women entrepreneurs may face through the economic empowerment of women, it aims to contribute to greater gender equality, as well as to more job creation and economic development.

Vision Fund Microfinance Institution S.C. (VFMFI) has been in operation since 1999 as a regulated and legally registered Microfinance service provider. Since then the Institution has been in business to cater services to its clients in the capital and three regional states namely Oromia, Amhara, and Southern Nations Nationalities and Peoples' Region (SNNPR) and Addis Ababa city Administration.

Vision fund micro finance applied and reach agreement to participate in the women entrepreneurship credit facility under WEDP and getting loans from Development bank of Ethiopia and able to finance its loan able fund requirement to empower women. In vision fund WEDP starts on Dec, 2016 and provide service for 812 clients with total disbursement amount of $135,973,038$ within its 7 branches up to Dec 2019., WEDP loans has affected the income of women, ability to save, asset accumulation, decision making ability, ability to manage their businesses entirely on their own, and expenditure on children education, creation or expansion of borrowers' own self-employment (job creation) for women in Ethiopia. However no major assessment has been made on the impact of the WEDP services particularly on the socio economic impact of women

### 1.2 Statement of the Problem

Globally, women participate in a wide range of entrepreneurial activities across the world although only few of them have been successful. This has between attributed to the fact that many women lack access to funds that they can use to start business enterprises (ILO, 2012).

Page | 3

Over the past decade, Ethiopia has achieved high economic growth, averaging $10.7 \%$ per year, establishing the country among the fastest growing economies both in Africa and the developing world .However, Ethiopia is falling behind its peers in the area of credit to the private sector (world bank,2016). At the same time, opportunities for women entrepreneurs in Ethiopia lag far behind those of men. In The Economist's Women's Economic Opportunity index, Ethiopia occupies the $107^{\text {th }}$ rank out of which they are served neither by commercial banks nor by microfinance institutions. High minimum loan sizes and excessive collateral requirements restrict women's access to loans from commercial banks. Microfinance Institutions (MFIs) primarily cater to microfirms with group lending schemes that provide very small loans. Growth-oriented women-owned enterprises are therefore starved of the investment they need to thrive (World Bank. 2019).

WEDP aims to minimize the financing gap in Ethiopia. In developing countries, 70 percent of small and medium businesses owned by women cannot obtain the financing needed for them to grow. The project tackles this issue by providing loans to female business owners. The project's objective is to "increase earnings and employment of micro and small enterprises (MSEs) owned or partly owned by participating female entrepreneurs in targeted cities".

Well over a third of WEDP borrowers manage their businesses entirely on their own and another $22 \%$ manage their businesses jointly with their husbands. An even larger group, $58 \%$ of respondents, report that they alone control the income from their businesses; about $20 \%$ of the borrowers make a major contribution to household income from earnings. There is less tension in their households because there is less financial strife, better food and a greater ability to meet their children's educational expenses; Several Women's aid that they no longer need to borrow from neighbors or money-lenders to finance their businesses or to meet household expenses;

Few have been able to increase their personal savings. For many of them, the savings facility offered by WEDP has enabled them to start a savings deposit account that was eventually grow with regular bi-weekly deposits;

WEDP's most significant impact on employment has been the creation or expansion of borrowers' own self-employment (Koopman, 2017)has brought positive impact to the life of clients, boost the ability of poor individuals to improve their conditions and have taken advantage of increased earnings to improve their consumption level

Despite the apparent success and popularity of WEDP, no conclusive evidence yet exists that WEDP programs have positive effects on socio-economic status of women (Armendáriz de Aghion and Morduch 2010; et al...) however with the increased growth of the WEDP clients and the attention the sector has received from government, donors and different micro finance in recent years, The existing microfinance WEDP impact assessment need to be re-investigated; the robustness of claims that microfinance successfully alleviates poverty and empowers women must be scrutinized more carefully. Hence, this study revisits the evidence of microfinance services evaluations focusing on the technical challenges of conducting rigorous socio-economic effect analysis of microfinance WEDP services

### 1.3 Research Questions

Hence, this study was based on the evidence of WEDP's data focusing its socio-economic impact on women entrepreneurs in the case study of Vision Fund Micro-Financing Institution, Addis Ababa branch.

The study was guided by the following research questions:

- What is the effect of women entrepreneurship development project (WEDP) loans on social welfare of households of women who own of Small and Medium Enterprises in Addis Ababa in terms of participation in decision making power, self-esteem, and business management skill?
- What is the effect of women entrepreneurship development project (WEDP) loans on economic welfare of households of women who own small and Medium Enterprises and their household's interims of income, saving and asset accumulation?
- What are the challenges experienced by women who own Small and Medium Enterprises in Addis Ababa in borrowing and repaying credit?


### 1.4 Research Objective

### 1.4.1 General Objective of the study

The overall objective of the study was to investigate the impact of women entrepreneurship development project (WEDP) loans on the socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs in the case study of Vision Fund Micro Finance Institution, Addis Ababa branch.

### 1.4.2 Specific Objectives

The study was addressed the following specific objectives:

- To determine the effect of women entrepreneurship development project (WEDP) loans on empowerment of women who own small and Medium Enterprises Addis Ababa.
- To assess the socio-economic effects of WEDP on women Entrepreneurs in the case of Vision Micro Financing institution in terms of participation in asset accumulation, decision making power, and business management skill.
- To analyze the effect of the availability of WEDP programs for women entrepreneurs in the case of Vision Micro Financing Institution.
- To assess the challenges of women entrepreneur in WEDP program in the case of Vision Micro Financing Institution.


### 1.5 Significance of the Study

The main objective of the study was to investigate the impact of women entrepreneurship development project (WEDP) loans on the socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs. The findings of the study were believed to show the economic and social benefits of WEDP delivery to women's economic empowerment in addition to its impact in enhancing their awareness and knowledge. Furthermore, the study was also identified the challenges women face with access to WEDP program at the MFI. The findings of the study were used by other researchers who might be interested to conduct further studies on the subject. In addition, the results of the study was serve as a source of information for people that need to know the role of WEDP in the empowerment of women and help MFI management to know the gap, results and help them in addressing the findings.

### 1.6 Scope of the Study

Due to time and budget limitation the research was focused on WEDP program launched in Addis Ababa branches of Vision Fund.

Even if, there are different micro finances lunched WEDP program and also in Vision fund there are some branches outside Addis Ababa, the focused area of this research was only 4 branches located in Addis Ababa branches. A large sample size made up of different Micro-Finance institutions from within and outside Addis Ababa could have allowed for generalizations of the findings even branches outside Addis Ababa of same MFI.

### 1.7 Limitation of the Study

Although there is much remains to be done, this research generates important findings in the field of Microfinance institutions. In other words, having acknowledged the limitations of data processing, it can nevertheless confirm that there are some limitations of this study. Although the present study has yielded some preliminary findings, its design is not without flaws. A number of requirements need to be noted regarding the present study.

This research was carefully prepared, but still aware of its limitations and shortcomings. First of all, the research was conducted using primary and secondary data analysis both quantitative and qualitative data analysis techniques. However, Primary data analysis using semi structured interview were difficult to find significant relationships from the data and lack of experience and skill in conducting a research on part of the researcher was also another limitation.

### 1.8 Organization of the Paper

The study is divided into five (5) main chapters or components. The first Chapter deals with the introductory aspect of the study whilst the second chapter is devoting to the reviewing of relevant literature. The third chapter is attempts on a presentation of the methods used in the study. The two remaining chapters-four and five highlight data presentation and analysis, and discussion of finding and recommendations respectively

## CHAPTER TWO - REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE:

### 2.1 Introduction

Women Entrepreneurism is an emerging concept. Since Women Entrepreneurism is an untapped resource of the nation that can be utilized effectively and due to the raising importance of women entrepreneurism, a number of studies have been made in this field. An attempt has been made to discuss the number of studies made previously in entrepreneurship in general and women entrepreneurship.

### 2.2 Understanding the concept of Socio-economic effects related to poverty

Socio-economic is a poverty related concept. Nevertheless, socio-economic can be defined as the study of factors that have negative influence on an individuals' economic activity including lack of education, cultural and religious discrimination, overpopulation, unemployment and corruption. Thus, poverty is a socio-economic issue. Poverty is also a variable that determines one's socioeconomic status - meaning, an individual's or group's position within a hierarchical social structure which depends on a combination of variables, including occupation, education, income, wealth, and place of living.

As per the United Nations, "poverty is fundamentally a denial of choices and opportunities, and a violation of human dignity. It means lack of basic capacity to participate effectively in society. It means not having enough to feed and clothe a family, not having a school or clinic to go to; not having the land on which to grow one's food or a job to earn one's living, not having access to credit. It means insecurity, powerlessness and exclusion of individuals, households and communities. It means susceptibility to violence, and it often implies living on marginal or fragile environments, without access to clean water or sanitation" (UN Statement, June 2011).

Therefore, generally the goal of socioeconomic study is to bring about socioeconomic development, usually in terms of improvements in metrics such as GDP, life expectancy, literacy, levels of employment, among others. Although harder to measure, changes in less-tangible factors are also considered, such as personal dignity, freedom of association, personal safety and freedom from fear of physical harm, and the extent of participation in civil society (Tony Lawson, 2010).

### 2.3. Theoretical Review of Entrepreneurship

### 2.3.1 Definition of Entrepreneurship

There are lots of literatures on what entrepreneurship is all about. According to Schumpeter (1954) being an entrepreneur is not a profession and entrepreneurs do not form a social class. This makes it very difficult to define an entrepreneur as a functional economic group or to classify one set of persons as entrepreneurs. Rather an entrepreneur be an element of the mechanism or agent of change.

Sandstrom (2005) states that entrepreneurship is discovering new business possibilities in the market which can be individual or people who start business based on an entirely new products or services; also, establishment of more handicraft or services oriented business with more imitative products and services.

Entrepreneurship is seen as fundamentally important part of modern economic and social life. Entrepreneurship has been of immense interest to researchers. Over the century's researchers belonging to various domains of knowledge have tried to decipher the dynamics of entrepreneurship. Cantillon was the first economist to introduce the term entrepreneur during 18th century, (Cantillon,. 1755). Say opined that profits that accrue to an entrepreneur are distinct from the one who supplied capital, (Say. 1803). Schumpeter introduced the concept of innovation in the theory of entrepreneurship, (Schumpeter, 1934). Entrepreneur can be defined as the one who maximizes opportunity (Drucker, 1964). Entrepreneurship can be defined as the process of using private initiative to transform a business concept into a new venture or to grow or diversify an existing venture or enterprise, it results in the creation, enhancement, realization and renewal of value not just for the owners but for all participants and stakeholders, (UNESCAP, 2005).Entrepreneurship is more than the mere creation of business, although that is certainly an important facet. The characteristics of seeking opportunities, taking risks beyond security and having the tenacity to push an idea through to reality combine into a special perspective that permeates entrepreneurs. Thus, entrepreneurship is an integrated concept that permeates an individual's business in an innovative manner, (Reynolds, 2007).

### 2.3.2 Women Entrepreneurship

With the emergence of women in the field of entrepreneurship, researchers have resorted to arrive at a comprehensive definition of women entrepreneur. Women who take onus to organize and manage the resources of their enterprises and bear all the risks in expectations of deriving profit can be termed as women entrepreneur. This definition portrays women entrepreneurs as conscious decision makers and managers (Coughlin, \& Thomas, 2002). Women who chose to pursue the challenging role of an entrepreneur driven by their desire to fulfill their need of independence and achievement. This definition is only applicable to women entrepreneurs who are opportunity driven, i.e. women who resort to entrepreneurship driven by their free will. This definition excludes necessity driven entrepreneurs who are forced to pursue entrepreneurship out of some bare need (Dhameja ,2002). When a women or group of women embark on initiating, organizing and managing their enterprise, they are termed as women entrepreneur (Suganthi, 2009). Creative activity of initiating and operating a business venture leading to economic empowerment and social betterment of women in the society can be termed as women entrepreneurship. This definition elaborates the positive, social and economic contribution of women entrepreneurship in the society (Munshi,et al, 2011).

### 2.3.3 Types of Entrepreneur

Timmons (1978) classify entrepreneurs as craftsman and opportunistic; Vasper (1980) classify entrepreneurs into economic, philosophy, business, political, communistic and social entrepreneurs; Minniti and Arenius (2003) classify entrepreneurs into nascent, new, opportunistic and necessity entrepreneurs. Thus, Grasfik (2000)) classify entrepreneurs into six different types which include; self-employed, traditional self-employed, growth-oriented, leisure or subsistence and network entrepreneurs.

## (i) The Self-employed Entrepreneur

This type of entrepreneur results from the establishment of new enterprise and the owner has the business as his primary occupation. At the initial stage of the business, the entrepreneur is both the self-employed and an entrepreneur. This type of business includes hotel business, restaurant business, trading etc.

## (ii) The Traditional Self-employed Entrepreneur:

This type of entrepreneur exists when someone has taken over and continues on running a personally owned enterprise and who is not necessarily an entrepreneur. This type of entrepreneur's is usually found in the service, trade and in rural district culture in occupation such as farming, building, construction, manufacturing and related occupation.

## (iii) The Growth-Oriented Entrepreneur:

The growth-oriented entrepreneur is usually neither registered as an entrepreneur nor as a selfemployed person. The business is usually registered as a limited company and the owner is known as growth-oriented entrepreneur (United Nations, 2006). They have better prospects of survival, innovation and growth than other entrepreneurs. Kerta (1993) sees this type of entrepreneurs as social entrepreneurs. Thus, Burlingham (1990) sees this type of entrepreneur as new breed of women entrepreneurship.

## (iv) The Family-Owner Entrepreneur:

The family enterprise is a business that is usually passed on from generation to generation. Under this type of entrepreneur, the new owners are neither entrepreneurs nor self-employed. Founding a company is considered a natural step in the growth or reorganization strategy of an enterprise, but the subject is only referred to briefly (Grafisk, 2000).

## (v) The Network Entrepreneur:

This type of entrepreneur is usually found in all traditional categories of life. The entrepreneur under this category in most cases is project oriented and establishes the business in line with the emergence of the projects. He or she may be an employer or a project manager in one project and then enter the next project as an employee. This type of enterprise can be found in consultancy services and information technology.

### 2.3.4 Characteristics of women entrepreneurship

By their nature, Women entrepreneurship constitute the most viable and veritable vehicle for selfsustaining industrial development. They possess common capability to grow an indigenous
enterprise culture more than any other strategy. Women entrepreneurs often have a special personality. They value autonomy and independence. They possess energy and high need for achievement. Women entrepreneurs often have a strong internal locus of control. They perceive change as opportunity and are willing to take careful risks (Udechukwu, 2004).

Moore, (1990) defines a female entrepreneur as the female head of a business who takes the initiative of launching a new venture, who is accepting the associated risks and the financial, administrative and social responsibilities and who is effectively in charge of its day-to-day activities.

Women entrepreneurs often have a special personality. They value autonomy and independence. They possess energy and a high need for achievement. Women Entrepreneurs often have a strong internal locus of control. They perceive change as opportunity and are willing to take careful risks. They usually have social skills and possess a balance between intuition and thinking.

### 2.3.5 Challenges facing women entrepreneurs

Although there are many contributions to be accredited to women entrepreneurs, a number of constraints have been identified as detriments to these contributors. Women entrepreneurs face many challenges, including government rules and regulations, gaining access to finance, and building an ICT infrastructure that enables efficiency and growth (United Nations, 2006).

Women entrepreneurs require confidence, leadership and management skills and must find ways to access new markets. Kantor (1999) argues that women often experience greater constraints on their economic actions relative to men. Mayoux (2001) states that there are certain factors that limit the ability of women entrepreneurs to take advantage of the opportunities available to them in their environment and these factors have been identified as the reasons why women business fails. These include poor financial management, liquidity problems, management inexperience and incompetence, problems in coping with inflation and other external economic conditions, poor or non-existent books and records, sales and marketing problems, staffing, difficulties with unions, the failure to seek expert advice, limited social and business networks, a low level of demand in the local economy, the value and system of tenure for housing, constraints in access to finance, lack of work experience and skill, and lack of role models (United Nations, 2006).

### 2.3.6 Contributions of women entrepreneurs in economic development

Entrepreneurship has no respect for sex, color, height, individuals, race or culture. Women in different nations play equal role with their men counterparts in economic development through entrepreneurship. An entrepreneur, whether male or female play important role in a particular economy. In an attempt to offer an acceptable definition of an entrepreneur, An entrepreneur is: a person who assumes the risks associated with uncertainty, an innovator, a decision maker, an industrial leader, an organizer and a coordinator of economic resources, a contractor, a resource allocator, a person who realizes a startup of a new business, an employer of other factors of production, the owner of an enterprise, manager or super rider, a person who supplies financial capital (Wennekers and Thurik, 1999).

Women entrepreneurship development has been recognized as important because of the contributions of women s entrepreneurs to the economic development in both developed and less developed countries.

Women entrepreneurs therefore enhance economic development through:

Employment creation: Women entrepreneurship development can help women owned businesses generate more income which then can be used to support their households and improve their family welfare outcomes (Thomson, 2002). This income can help women to start and grow their businesses which will in turn help them to offer employment to others in their community.

Poverty alleviation: Many women support themselves and their families through the income they receive from their entrepreneurial activities (Kantor, 1999). Women also are more involved in organizing programs that focused on empowering women and youths for poverty alleviation.

Economic Vitality: Economic vitality is a necessary condition for achieving social vitality which improves the standard of living of the citizens of nation. Important factors that make living attractive are flow of information, education, health, housing and transportation which are developed and sustained through entrepreneurship. The easiest approach to economic vitality is through women entrepreneurship development. Women have been known for their ability to combine different activities that have the potential to enhance the standards of living and quality of life of the citizenries. Floro (2001) argues that women are more likely to juggle their working

Page | 13
time between the market sector and non-market economic activities. Non-market production whether it involves subsistence crop production, water and fuel gathering, food preparation and housecleaning or care for the children and elderly is a crucial element in determining the quality of life.

Economic and socio-political empowerment: Women now have access to and control over income and working conditions. This has empowered them for full involvement and participation in economic, social and political policy making that might result to changes in gender inequality and discrimination especially in the labor market. It is believed that with self-employment and entrepreneurship, women gained confidence, self-esteem and decision-making experience leading to greater control over their lives in social, economic and political spheres (Kantor, 2017).

Financial sustainability: Small enterprises tend to have the flexibility and innovativeness that are critical business needs in developing economy. As women form micro and macro enterprises and bring their values, products and services to the marketplace, they become involved in changing the face of the nation's business.

As Steinem (1992) notes, women entrepreneurs tend to take a holistic approach to balanced life, work, family, economic, and cultural values. They integrate economic techniques such as job training, job creation, marketing and management with workplace innovations such as flexible scheduling, childcare, language workshop for immigrants.
(vi). Economic growth: The increase of women prominence in entrepreneurship has positive contribution to the country s G D P and Gross National Income (GNI) (Kantor, 1999). Statistically, more than $30 \%$ of the contributions of the country s GDP, comes from women that are selfemployed especially in micro and small sized enterprises (Kerta, 1993). This sector of business and its entrepreneurial characteristics are viewed by many to be central to innovation and are considered the engine of economic growth.

Wealth creation: Wealth creation and social vitality are the economic goals of both men and women entrepreneurs. To achieve this, women entrepreneurs usually combine their efforts to form a strong base either in the rural or urban areas and channel the same towards economic development. Teamwork, networking and managerial competence have been recommended as
good promotional strategies that can be adopted by women entrepreneurs to pull their resources together towards best business practices, contacts, and references. Business networks can help women identify and secure partners for future transactions (Thomson, 2002).

Economic: Job creation both for the women and others can be a panacea for the increasing unemployment/under employment rate in the country. Women are afforded opportunities to create their own businesses and make adequate use of their acquired skills and training.

Social: Women are contributing immensely to both their families and the communities. Most of the women-owned enterprises are serving not only the communities but also larger business organizations. They also offer women the possibilities of effectively managing their dual role as career women and as mothers at home.

Political: Although politically, there are few women in political position. Encouraging women enterprise will considerably help to reduce the disparities between women and men increase their autonomy and allow them to play a more active role in the political and economic life of their country (Thomson, 2002).

### 2.3.7 Challenges facing women entrepreneurs

Although there are many contributions to be accredited to women entrepreneurs, several constraints have been identified as detriments to these contributors. Women entrepreneurs face many challenges, including government rules and regulations, gaining access to finance, and building an ICT infrastructure that enables efficiency and growth (United Nations, 2006).

Women entrepreneurs require confidence, leadership and management skills and must find ways to access new markets. Kantor (1999) argues that women often experience greater constraints on their economic actions relative to men. Mayoux (2001) states that there are certain factors that limit the ability of women entrepreneurs to take advantage of the opportunities available to them in their environment and these factors have been identified as the reasons why women business fails. These include poor financial management, liquidity problems, management inexperience and incompetence, problems in coping with inflation and other external economic conditions, poor or non-existent books and records, sales and marketing problems, staffing, difficulties with unions, the failure to seek expert advice, limited social and business networks, a low level of demand in
the local economy, the value and system of tenure for housing, constraints in access to finance, lack of work experience and skill, and lack of role models (United Nations, 2006).

Lack of access to control of property: The restriction of women from having access to and control of property constitutes a fundamental constraint on women entrepreneurs. The legal system in most countries has not been able to recognize and enforce women s equal right to property and ownership. Statistically, International Labor Organization (ILO) has on record that only $1 \%$ of the world's assets are in the name of women (Mayoux, 2001). Property in this context includes; land, houses, lockup-stores, production plants, equipment, motor van etc. Legal backing on women's access to and control of property will help women in setting up their own firms without much stress.

Lack of access to and control over income: Another constraint that faces women entrepreneurs is lack of access to and control over income. Low income, low investment and low profit may limit women $s$ ability to save. This affects their income, investment, and savings. Inability to save, can affect their start-up capital there by discouraging them from owing businesses.

Mayoux (2011) observes that Women have limited control over the incomes they earn. Gendered rights and responsibilities between man and women within households invariably operate to constrain women s ability to control their own income and access to male income. Even when women have opportunity to earn high income, by virtue of culture and tradition, they are subjected under their husbands who have control over them and their money. This can hinder their participation in business.

Lack of access to information technology: The number of women in the technology is very low unlike in other sectors such as health care, hotel, education, restaurant etc.

Lack of information on women entrepreneurship: there is little information available on women entrepreneurship or women owned business particularly and, in the world, generally.

Age limit: Unlike men, there are certain periods in a woman age/time that she cannot do business for instance, during pregnancy, labor period, child nursing and such other times that are peculiar to woman. Due to this, entrepreneurship therefore tends to be a midlife choice for women. Hence, majority of women start up business after the age of 35 (Dane, I984).

Family dependence: Most of the family members depend on women for care and hospitality, thereby limiting their full involvement and participation in business.

Restriction to family business: Most women entrepreneurs are somehow restricted to family business because of their family commitment. This affects their level of ingenuity, creativity, innovativeness and competitiveness.

Inaccessibility to required funds: Women also may not have equal opportunity to access finance from external sources such as banks, and other finance institutions as a result of this, they tend to prefer using personal credit/saving in financing their business. This discourages a lot of women from going into entrepreneurship.

Religious predicament: Some religion prohibits women from coming out of their homes and environments thereby restricting them from getting involved in business.

Noninvolvement of women in decision making: Women all over the world and in all sectors are usually marginalized, especially in the planning stage of development.

Much emphasis on domestic role: No matter the role of a woman in the society, she is mainly remembered for the domestic role. A woman, whether a director of a company, an educationalist, an entrepreneur, or a professional, must go back to the kitchen. The popular saying that a woman education ends in the kitchen - tends to prohibit women from going into business. The kitchen role dominates every other role of a woman (Kpohazounde, 1994).

Limited leadership role: Women are usually given the seconding position in company s meetings and as government functionaries. For instance, in meetings (not women meetings) a women cannot move motion, but she can second it (Mayoux, 2001).

Mayoux (2001) observes that there are certain factors that limit women entrepreneurs' ability to take advantage of the opportunities available to them in their environment and these factors have been identified as the reasons why their business fail. These factors include: poor financial management liquidity problems management inexperience and incompetence poor or non-existent books and records sales and marketing problems staffing difficulties with unions the failure to seek expert advice limited social and business networks a low level of demand in the local economy the
value and system of tenure for housing constraints in access to finance lack of work experience and skill, and lack of role models.

### 2.4. Empirical Review on Women Entrepreneurship

Everett. Hagen (1962) attempted to study the origin of entrepreneurs in many countries. He noted that the entrepreneurs have emerged mainly from a particular socio-economic class.

Natarajan and M. Kavitha (2003) suggested that the financial institution assisting women entrepreneurs shall provide necessary guidelines to the women entrepreneurs for getting financial assistance at the right time.

Berna (1966) in her study entitled "Industrial Entrepreneurship in Chennai State" found that the entrepreneurs hailed from diverse castes, occupations and classes, as only small - scale operations they came up to their present positions and diversified their production. This is attributed to their youth, education and technical training.

KameshwarJha (1970) in his study of the growth of entrepreneurship in Bihar State, in 1970, has observed that favorable economic conditions have a good effect on the change in entrepreneurship and the change in social structure which is due to education. He added that profit motive has no influence on such changes.

LavanyaLatha (2006) suggested that the hard work, self-confidence, self-determination, personality traits and availability of timely financial support were the important factors for success of women entrepreneurs.

MadhurBala and Monga have (2007) associated and opined that the women employment supplements the family income and enhances their economic status and places them in higher income group. Among employed women, their better education, employment and improved family income, all the three raises their socio-economic status and place them in upper or upper - middle class from lower or upper - lower class.

Surti and Sarupriya (1983) investigated the psychological factors affecting women entrepreneurs. The results indicated that unmarried women experienced less stress and fewer dependents than
married women. The women from joint families tended to experience less role stress than subjects from nuclear families, probably because they share their problems with other family members.
M.Sumathy and Mr.K.Nagendran (2007) have expressed in their article that, the women of today certainly play a vital role in the development of the society. By sharing time, appreciation, knowledge and ideas, friendship, kindness and experience women manages the busy world today. Their success is mainly because of their ability to relax optimistically, listen deeply, feel empathetically, respond carefully, synchronize co-operatively, act authentically and acknowledge generously. After all that is the essence of women empowerment.

### 2.5. Conceptual Framework

The study derived its conceptual framework through definition of relationship between independent and dependent variables.


Fig 1.1: Conceptual framework
Source: researcher (Nov, 2019)

Women Empowerment will be assessed by looking at issues such as purchase of assets before and after credit, nutrition and health and education before and after credit provision. Job creation will be assessed by examining how many businesses and consequently jobs that have been created by use of credit received. Economic Welfare of the women will be empowered if they get the funds from the women Enterprise fund thus through acquisition of this funds they will be empowered economically. The Household Social welfare of women is directly affected by Women Enterprise Fund. Job creation will be analyzed by considering the number of businesses started courtesy of the credit provided and consequently the number of employees including the owner who benefit from that business directly. The living conditions will be analyzed by looking at whether there has been any change in terms of nutrition, education and the physical assets of the borrowers after credit provision

## CHAPTER THREE - RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

### 3.1 Introduction

This chapter outlines the research design that was used in the study, the target population, sample size and sampling procedures, data collection instruments together was determined, data collection procedures, and data analysis techniques in the research process.

According to Walliman . 2011, research methodology is basically a process of how a research is being conducted. It encompasses tools and techniques to conduct a particular research or finding. Research method is a range of tools that are used for different types of enquiry and it is important to select an accurate method that suits the research objective. Therefore, this chapter discusses the research design, area of study, population, sample of the population, sampling technique, and instrument for data collection, administration of the data collection instrument and method of data analysis.

### 3.1 Research Design

Research design means a structure to plan and execute a particular research. Research design is the crucial part of the research as it includes the strategy of the study, the conceptual framework of the study, the identification of whom and what to study on and the tools and procedures to be used for collecting and analyzing data (Holmes ,2005).

In this study, the researcher has used a combination of both qualitative as well as quantitative research approaches. The researcher believes that using these two (mixed) methods simultaneously enables to tackle the research problem under the study. The term "mixed methods" refers to an emergent methodology of research that advances the systematic integration, or "mixing," of quantitative and qualitative data within a single investigation or sustained program of inquiry. The basic premise of this methodology is that such integration permits a more complete and synergistic utilization of data than do separate quantitative and qualitative data collection and analysis (Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality (AHRQ), 2019).

According to Bryman\& Bell, 2003, the two main types of research approaches used in social sciences are quantitative and qualitative research approaches. Quantitative research approach
refers to the systematic empirical investigation of phenomena and quantitative properties and their relationships. It emphasizes on collection of numerical data, which is a deductive approach. On the other hand, qualitative research approach refers to all non-numeric data or data that have not been quantified and can be a product of all research strategies (Saunders et al, 2009). It can range from a short list of responses to open-ended questions in an online questionnaire to more complex data such as transcripts of in-depth interviews or entire policy documents (Saunders et al, 2009).

### 3.2 Data Sources and Data Collection Method

The research was used both primary and secondary sources of data. Primary data was collect to attain the research objectives regarding to the social and economic impact of WEDP on women entrepreneurs, its contribution on improving women's decision making power, self-esteem, and business management skill, and build up their asset as well as participants view of the strength and limitation of WEDP by using Survey/questionnaire, Focused Group Desiccation (FGD), and key informant interviews. In order to address the objective of outreach performance of WEDP secondary data source was obtained from unpublished WEDP documents as well as key informant's interview with the project coordinators and staffs.

The Data was collected through Documentation, Survey/Questionnaires, Focus Group Discussion (FGD), and Key Informants Interviews (KIIs).
i. Documentation: involves collecting information and data from existing surveys, reports and documents of Vision Fund Microfinance Institution S.C. (VFMFI), women entrepreneurship development project (WEDP) project as well as any relevant Publications.
ii. Survey/Questionnaire: This is used to collect information from beneficiaries and nonbeneficiaries of Vision Fund Microfinance Institution S.C. (VFMFI), women entrepreneurship development project (WEDP) project. For this purpose, structured questionnaires was developed and it administrated that obtaining quantitative data on issues regarding the impact of women entrepreneurship development project (WEDP) loan services on the socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs based on selected indicators.
iii. Focus Group Discussion (FGD): was done to complement the survey data. The main purpose of FGD is to draw upon beneficiaries' attitudes, feelings, beliefs, experiences and
reaction. FGD participants were selected from each of branches and the researcher was use funnel approach. This approach involves the use of broad questions followed gradually by more narrow questions) in collecting information (Regally, 1996).
iv. Key Informants Interviews (KIIs): Key informants was used based on their knowledge about related issue to women entrepreneurship development project (WEDP) project and clients' prior economic as well as social conditions. Key informants' interviews was prepared for Vision Fund Microfinance Institution S.C. officials, Branch Mangers', coordinators, and some of the beneficiaries of women entrepreneurship development project (WEDP) loan services.

### 3.3 Population and Sampling

## A. Study Area

Vision Fund Micro Finance Institution (S.C) is an Institution established according to proclamation No. 40/96 to provide financial services to the productive poor in the rural and urban areas of Ethiopia. Vision Fund is currently operating in four of the Regional States of the country.

Vision Fund Microfinance Institution S.C. (VFMFI) has been in operation since 1999 as a regulated and legally registered Microfinance service provider. Since then the Institution has been in business to cater services to its clients in the capital and three regional states namely Oromia, Amhara, and Southern Nations Nationalities and Peoples' Region (SNNPR) and Addis Ababa city Administration.

The MFI is gearing up with the strategic objective of becoming a large-scale sustainable, rural focused financial institution that makes significant impact on the lives of poor communities through provision of customer-oriented credit and saving services. Currently (as of Nov, 2019), VFMFI operates in 65 branch networks and 5 sub offices having loan portfolio and saving balance of ETB 1,205,062,646 and ETB 552 million respectively. The number of active clients and total employees as of the stated date reached 176,296 and 642 in that order and total women borrowers are 86,419 . VFMFI serves its clients through offering loan products including: Agriculture loan, Agribusiness loan, Business loan, Individual loan, and Family loan and Enterprise loan along with delivering different saving products. The institution has undertaken various bilateral agreements with various institutions to improve its service variety, availability and social impact. In part of
this activity, different partnership agreements are reached with partners WEDP is one of the program vision fund work with it by collaboration with government of Ethiopia development bank of Ethiopia (DBE) and Federal MSE development agency.

Starting from 2019 VFMFI implemented WEDP in urban area of Ethiopia (Addis Ababa 6 branches, Hawasa and Adama,) total number of WEDP clients as on Nov 2019 under all branches are 753 with total disbursement amount of $123,333,038$. Out of this this research was focused on only in Addis Ababa 4 branches (Lideta, Shola, Kolfe and Kirkos Branches). As of Oct 31, 2019, in Vision fund MFI within 4 branches there are 419 clients with total disbursement amount of 64,280,000.

## B. Population

The study population refers to the large groups of people or things (Ruane, 2005). The study population for this research was covered staff members, beneficiary of WEDP program in vision Fund microfinance institutions, and clients who are ready to get services from WEDP program in the near future but not yet received the services from this WEDP project, this non beneficiary clients are women clients who are fulfill the WEDP requirement and ready to get the loan. To analyze the socio-economic impact of WEDP on women entrepreneurs, focus has been given to the women which are access to and using the WEDP services from vision fund micro finance more than three years. This population was given priority due to the needy of getting realistic evidence. Indeed the total size of the population is 419 consisting of female entrepreneurs who are clients of vision fund MFI 4 branches in Addis Ababa.

## C. Sampling Procedure and Sample Size

Determining the appropriate sample size is important in research undertaking. Thus, sample size depends on the total number of populations, the level of confidence and the maximum deviation from true population that can be tolerated in the study. The study is used two groups of samples namely, experimental or treatment group and control group. Control group are used to avoid the problem of intervening variables (variables that are affecting the output of the research other than independent variables).The researcher was apply a simplified formula provided by (Yamane, 1967) as cited by Yilma Muluken to determine the minimum required treatment group sample size at $95 \%$ confidence level, degree of variability $=0.5$ and level of precision (e) $=10 \%$.

$$
\mathrm{n}=\frac{\mathrm{N}}{1+\mathrm{N}(\mathrm{e})^{2}}
$$

Where n is sample size, N is the total number of study population 419

Where e is the level of precision

Treatment group was composed of women entrepreneurs clients who are users of WEDP services in vision fund micro finances of Addis Ababa branches at least for three years, whereas control groups are a clients in the training or incoming clients (clients ready to get service of WEDP program in the near future but not yet in the pipe line at present). This is done to see whether the improvements of social and economic of Women clients could easily be achieved without joining the WEDP loan program.

Using the total population of 419 and level of precision of $10 \%$, the sample size was calculated as follows.

$$
\begin{align*}
& \mathrm{n}=\frac{419}{1+419(0.10)^{2}} \\
& \mathrm{n}=\frac{419}{1+419(0.010)} \\
& \mathrm{n}=4.419=81
\end{align*}
$$

100 control groups are selected from the list of people who are in the training phase or incoming clients; (clients ready to get WEDP service from vision fund in the near future). To make the research result more feasible and the beneficiaries was easily available to respond the questionnaires, from the total population size, 120 samples were used as treatment group while 100 are used as control group and total of 220 samples was selected

On the other hand, the participant of Key informant interviews and Focus Group Discussion was selected purposively.

### 3.4 Methods of Data Analysis

### 3.4.1 Descriptive statistics

Descriptive statistics like mean, variance, standard deviations, frequency distributions, and percentages was used to assess the socio-economic situations of the sample respondents. From the statistical tools, Chi Square test was used for dummy variables to investigate the difference between the treatment and control groups.

### 3.4.2 Propensity score matching

Rosenbaum and Rubin (1983) pioneered propensity score matching methodology followed by many other improvements and applications. They define propensity score as conditional probability of treatment given pretreatment characteristics. Their argument is based on the fact that since assignment of subject to treatment and control groups may not be random, the estimation of the effect of treatment may be biased by the existence of confounding factors.

Therefore, they proposed propensity score matching as a way-out to correct the estimation of effect of the participant controlling for the existence of these confounding factors. Based on the idea that the bias is reduced when the comparison is performed using treatment and control who are as similar as possible. This study was applying the propensity-score matching method to match each treatment client with control clients who had (almost) the same probability of joining microfinance participant. A group of control client was selected in this way can then serve as an accurate control group to correct for selection bias. To achieve main research question of this study, propensity score matching which makes matching feasible was applied. Propensity score is a conditional probability estimator, and any discrete model such as logit or probit can be used as they yield similar results (Caliendo and Kopeinig, 2008). This study has employed logit model assuming logistic distribution of the sample mean and variances. The matching estimators are nearest neighbor, stratified, radius and caliper, and kernel matching method all conditional on propensity score. The propensity score model is expressed as:
$\qquad$
Where $\mathrm{D}=(1,0)$ the indicators of improvement in income, it is the binary variable whether a participating clients income improve ( improvement in income, $1=$ yes, $0=$ otherwise ) $\chi i=$ is a
vector of pretreatment covariate propensity score to ensure that matching estimation is done on treatment and control clients that are as similar as possible for effective comparison. As a result, given a population of units denoted by (i) if the propensity score P (xi) is known as average effect of treatment (AET) can be estimated as

$$
\begin{align*}
& \mathrm{AET}=\mathrm{E}\{\mathrm{Y} 1 \mathrm{i}-\mathrm{Yoi} / \mathrm{Di}=1\}  \tag{2.}\\
& =\{\mathrm{E}\{\mathrm{Y} 1 \mathrm{i}-\mathrm{Y} 0 \mathrm{i} / \mathrm{DI}=1, \mathrm{P}(\mathrm{xi})\}\} \\
& =E\{E\{Y 1 i / D 1=1, P(x i)\}-E\{Y 0 i / D i=0 P(x i\} / D i=1\}
\end{align*}
$$

Where AET is the average effect of treatment Y1i and Y0i are the potential outcome for the two counter factual situations of the treatment client and control client respectively. P (xi) is propensity score, D is client variable, where $\mathrm{D}=1$ if the clients participated in microfinance and 0 otherwise. This model works under two assumptions:

1) The balancing assumption: States that participation is shaped by pre participation characteristics or that the balancing of participants and control is through the propensity score. Therefore, if $\mathrm{P}(\mathrm{xi})$ is the propensity score then
$\mathrm{D} \perp \mathrm{X} / \mathrm{P}(\mathrm{X})$
$\perp$ represents independence i.e. exposure to the program participant (D) is shaped by the participation covariates $(\mathrm{Xi})$ the balancing assumption is thus the propensity score $\mathrm{P}(\mathrm{D})=1, \mathrm{Xi}=$ P(xi).
2) Conditional independence assumption: Assume that selection is biased on observable covariate of the subject and treat all the covariates that influence participation and potential outcomes are simultaneously observed. It is expressed as
$\qquad$

Where Y1, Y0 are potential outcomes with and without the program respectively, Di is participation variable, $\mathrm{P}(\mathrm{x})$ is propensity score. In other words, for a given propensity score
exposure to program is random and therefore participant and control clients should be on average observationally identical (Caliendo and Kopeinig, 2008).

A logit model was applied to estimate propensity scores using a composite of predictors characteristics of the sampled clients (Rosenbaum and Robin, 1983) and matching was then performed using propensity scores of each observation. In estimating the logit model, the dependent variable is participation in microfinance services, which takes the value of 1 if a household participates in microfinance service and 0 otherwise. The mathematical formulation of logit model is as follows:

$$
\mathcal{p}_{i}=\frac{e^{Z i}}{1+e^{Z i}}
$$

Where, Pi is the probability of clients to participate in microfinance services,

$$
Z_{i}=\alpha_{0}+\sum_{i=1}^{n} \alpha_{1} x_{i}+u_{i}
$$

Where $\mathrm{I}=1,2,3 \ldots . \mathrm{n}$
$\alpha 0=$ intercept
$\alpha \mathrm{i}=$ intercept regression coefficient to be estimated
$\mathrm{xi}=$ predictors or explanatory independent variable and
$\mathrm{ui}=\mathrm{a}$ disturbance term,

The probability that a household belongs to non-participant or control group is

$$
1-p=\frac{1}{1+e^{Z i}}
$$

The mean impact of participant in microfinance is given by

$$
\begin{align*}
& I=\sum_{J=1}^{P}\left(Y i j 1-\sum_{I=1}^{N P} Y i j 0\right) \\
& \text { /P ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... } 9 \tag{9}
\end{align*}
$$

Where, Y ij 1 is the post intervention income level of beneficiary $\mathrm{j}, \mathrm{Y} \mathrm{Yj} 0$ is the income level of the $i^{\text {th }}$ non-beneficiary matched to the $\mathrm{j}^{\text {th }}$ beneficiary, $P$ is the total number of participant or treatment client, NP is the total number of non-participant or control and I is income level in birr.

Rosenbaum and Robin, (1983), the logit model via which the propensity score is generated include predictor variables that influence the selection procedure or participation in the program and the outcome of interest. Several factors guide selection of predictor variables. In this study, an explanatory variable of the logit model is identified using findings of previous empirical studies on impact of microfinance on household income level, and own field observation. The study includes as many explanatory variables as possible to minimize the problem of unobservable characteristics in the study.

### 3.4.2.1 Matching estimators

After estimation of the propensity scores, seeking an appropriate matching estimator is the major task. Estimation of the propensity score per se is not enough to estimate the ATT of interest. This is due to the fact that propensity score is a continuous variable and the probability of observing two units with exactly the same propensity score is, in principle, zero. There are a number of matching methods that differ from each other with respect to the weights they attribute to the selected controls when estimating the counterfactual outcome of the treated and the way they select the control units that are matched to the treated. However, they all provide consistent estimates of the ATT under the CIA and the overlap condition (Caliendo and Kopeinig, 2008). The most commonly used matching estimators nearest neighbors matching, radius matching, kernel matching, caliper matching are discussed below. First, nearest neighbor (NN) matching, it is the most straight forward matching estimator. In NN matching, an individual from a comparison group is chosen as a matching partner for a treated individual that is closest in terms of propensity score
(Caliendo and Kopeinig, 2008). NN matching can be done with or without replacement options. In the case of the NN matching with replacement, a comparison individual can be matched to more than one treatment individuals, which would result in increased quality of matches and decreased precision of estimates. On the other hand, in the case of NN matching without replacement, a comparison individual can be used only once. Matching without replacement increases bias but it could improve the precision of the estimates. In cases where the treatment and comparison units are very different, finding a satisfactory match by matching without replacement can be very problematic (Dehejia and Wahba, 2002). It means that by matching without replacement, when there are few comparison units similar to the treated units, we may be forced to match treated units to comparison units that are quite different in terms of the estimated propensity score.

Second, stratification or interval matching, this procedure partitions the common support into different strata (or intervals) and calculates the program's impact within each interval. Specifically, within each interval, the program effect is the mean difference in outcomes between treated and control observations. A weighted average of these interval impact estimates yields the overall program impact, taking the share of participants in each interval as the weights.

Thirdly, caliper or radius matching, the above discussion tells that NN matching faces the risk of bad matches, if the closest neighbor is far away. To overcome this problem researchers, use the second alternative matching algorism called caliper matching. Caliper matching means that an individual from the comparison group is chosen as a matching partner for a treated individual that lies within a given caliper (propensity score range) and is closest in terms of propensity score (Caliendo and Kopeinig, 2008). If the dimension of the neighborhood is set to be very small, it is possible that some treated units are not matched because the neighborhood does not contain a control unit. On the other hand, the smaller the size of the neighborhood the better is the quality of the matches (Becker and Ichino, 2002). One problem in caliper matching is that it is difficult to know a priori what choice for the tolerance level is reasonable.

Fourth, kernel and local linear matching, this is another matching method whereby all treated units are matched with a weighted average of all controls with weights which are inversely proportional to the distance between the propensity scores of treated and controls (Becker and Ichino 2002; Venetoklis, 2004). Kernel weights the contribution of each comparison group member so that more

Page | 30
importance is attached to those comparators providing a better match. The difference from caliper matching, however, is that those who are included are weighted according to their proximity with respect to the propensity score. The most common approach is to use the normal distribution (with a mean of zero) as a kernel, where the weight attached to a particular comparator is proportional to the frequency of the distribution for the difference in scores observed.

According to Caliendo and Kopeinig (2008) a drawback of this method is that possibly bad matches are used as the estimator includes comparator observations for all treatment observation. Hence, the proper imposition of the common support condition is of major importance for kernel matching method. A practical objection to its use is that it was often not be obvious how to set the tolerance. According to Mendola (2007) kernel matching with 0.25 band width is most commonly used. This study also was use kernel matching following Mendola recommendations.

### 3.4.2.2 Common support

Imposing a common support condition ensures that any combination of characteristics observed in the treatment group can also be observed among the control group (Becker and Ichino, 2002). The common support is the region where the balancing score has positive density for both treatment and control units. No matches can be formed to estimate the TT parameter (or the bias) when there is no overlap between the treatment and control groups. We define the region of common support by dropping observations below the maximum of the minimums and above the minimum of the maximums of the balancing score.

### 3.5. Definition and Measurement of Variables

A combination of socio economic and demographic variables is used to explain client's participation in microfinance program as well as the outcomes in terms of socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs activity.

### 3.5.1 The Dependent Variable of the Model

Participation in microfinance is a dummy variable indicating that whether clients is treatment or control client, 1 for treatment participating household, and 2 other wise or control clients.

### 3.5.2 Description of Explanatory Variables

1. Income of Clients (TOINCOM): Increasing income gives the households many options, increases consumption possibilities, allows the households the possibility of saving for future, reduces the weaknesses arising from future income failures and gives the children better educational opportunities. Hence, rising household income has a place in all socio- economic development of women entrepreneur's activity programs including Vision Fund microfinance programs. Therefore, the impact of Vision Fund micro finance Institute on the income of its participants needs to be evaluated to see the extent to which microfinance programs have been successful in alleviating socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs.
2. Saving of Clients (SAVR): MFIs are spending much cost on awareness creation among their users so as to mobilize huge amount of saving and made that saving as a source of money for further lending (Meyer 2002). Saving culture of a people can play key impact in assuring sustainability of microfinance services. Savings can be used in case of emergencies, or to finance major purchases, investments or to smoothen out consumption.
3. Assets accumulation (FIXA): Assets accumulation plays a multitude of impacts among clients of microfinance service. The ways in which households use assets to smooth out consumption is a well-documented process. Households purchase assets when their income is better and sell them during the lean periods therefore assets also serve as a form of saving. Besides an asset accumulation by borrowers is expected to have a positive impact on loan repayment performance having the perception that the assets were under liability in case of default. In fact, material assets which included other physical and financial assets like for instance land, housing, livestock, saving and jewelry, enable people to withstand shocks and expand their horizon of choices (World Bank, 2002). The researcher wants to evaluate the effectiveness of Vision Fund Micro-financial service on the level of asset accumulation of the clients.
4. Decision Making Power: Women's ability to influence or make decisions that affect their lives and their future is measured to be one of the important components of empowerments. Many microfinance institutions focus their attention on women's use of loan and ability to make decisions about loan-based enterprises as the most direct impact of their program (Cheston and Kuhn, 2002). Thus, the measure of client's autonomy in the household decision making was
constructed to capture client's empowerment status. It was measured by the extent of their participation and impact in making decisions on issues such as expending money, use of profits from the loan based enterprise, puts loan enterprise income in the saving accounts, buying raw material and selling , using small items and use of loan. In such cases, the Vision Fund clients was asked whether they have made these decisions mostly alone, jointly with partner /children or spouses made them alone in both before and after the loan.
5. Number of Clients: in analyzing the effectiveness of microfinance in alleviating socioeconomic development of women entrepreneurs, it is crucial to look at the outreach's performance of MFIs. It is argued that microfinance can play an important impact in socio- economic development of women entrepreneur's alleviation only if the extent of outreach is reasonably large (Tsegaye, 2005). Conversely, if MFIs are restricted to only few geographical locations or serve only a small fraction of the population or the poor, their importance in socio- economic development of women entrepreneur's alleviation efforts would be limited (Mayoux, 1997). Outreach of microfinance sector can be looked at in numerous aspects among a few are the number of clients outreached and loan disbursed over the years
6. Age (AGER): It is continuous variable defined as clients age at the time of interview measured in years. Vigano (1993) noted that with increase in age, it is usually expected that participants get more stability and acquire experience. So, we expect this variable to have a positive effect on performance. Hence age of the participant was hypothesized to have positively related to income. In other words, the probability of being microfinance treatment client increases with age.
7. Sex (SEXR): This is a dummy variable which takes a value 2 if the household head is female and 1 otherwise. Sex difference among microfinance clients play a significant impact in the economic performance of a given clients. Some empirical evidences demonstrated that sex is important in defining the economic impact of people in Africa (Dey, 1980). More specifically sex differentials can be related to access to microfinance services. This variable is included to differentiate between males and females in the use of microfinance. Women's are generally more likely to participate in small business and assumed to be microfinance client and in microfinance operation females are given priority. Therefore, in this study sex is expected to correlate positively when the participating household head is female.
8. Marital Status (MARR): this is a variable whether a household is engaged in marriage or not. Married individuals are more likely than single one`s to participate in microfinance services. Usually microfinance institutions provide small loan and other financial services depending on individual's behavior and characteristics. Respondents were ask about their marital status whether they are unmarried, married widow/widower or divorced in their life. The expectation of this variable was positive relationship with income if a household is married and had family responsibility with participation in microfinance.
9. Educational status (EDUR): Household income is expected to be much higher when household head attain a higher level of education. According to Holvet (2004) education is an input in income since it provides the means of earning a higher income via enhancing earning capabilities. It is also a welfare outcome in itself as it allows individuals to participate in decision making that determine the well-being. Literate individuals may get more information about financial services in their residential area than individuals with no formal education.
10. Family Size (FMSZR): this variable refers to a total number of family members of the household make their life under one roof regardless of age and sex. Existence of large household size with limited income source could affect participation in microfinance. This indicates that it has positive impact on income. This is due to increased demand for consumption with limited income source. Therefore, the larger household size wascome treatment household and it was have positive relationship on income generating ability of the household member.
11. Dependency Ratio (DPRR): continuous variable defined as number of dependent household members. This refers to total number of economically inactive members of a household whose age is below 18 years and above 65 years old. This variable tells us the proportion of household members who are dependent on the active members of the family. It was expected that the more the number of dependent in a household the lower the income level would be because the per capita income lowers as the number of dependent increases.

## CHAPTER FOUR- DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

This chapter provides the empirical findings obtained from the collected data along with discussions explaining the findings of the study. The primary information was collected from both beneficiaries of WEDP loan product through a questionnaire, focus group discussion and key informant interview and the secondary information collected from relevant recorded data of WEDP program.

### 4.1 Institutional Profile and Outreach Performance of Vision Fund Micro Finance Institution, (WEDP)

### 4.1.1 Institutional Profile of Vision Fund Micro Finance Institution, WEDP

Vision Fund Microfinance Institution S.C. (VFMFI) has been in operation since 1999 as a regulated and legally registered Microfinance service provider. Since then the Institution has been in business to cater services to its clients in the capital and three regional states namely Oromia, Amhara, and Southern Nations Nationalities and Peoples' Region (SNNPR) and Addis Ababa city Administration.

Vision fund micro finance applied and reach agreement to participate in the women entrepreneurship credit facility under WEDP and getting loans from Development bank of Ethiopia and able to finance its loan able fund requirement to empower women. In vision fund WEDP starts on Dec, 2015 and provide service for 812 clients with total disbursement amount of 135,973,038 within its 7 branches up to Dec 2018.

Women's Entrepreneurship Development Project (WEDP) is a $\$ 50$ million IDA investment lending operation designed to address the key constraints for growth-oriented women entrepreneurs in Ethiopia. DFATD Canada and UK's DFID are key development partners funding part of the project's activities with an additional $\$ 13$ million. The project was effective in October 2012. The objective of Women's Entrepreneurship Development Project (WEDP) is to increase earnings and employment for women-owned enterprises in Ethiopia. It addresses the key constraints for growth-oriented women entrepreneurs in Ethiopia. (World Bank, IBRD, ID report July 21, 2016)

WEDP's line of credit involves a market "up-scaling" operation where the Development Bank of Ethiopia (DBE) acts as a wholesaler and MFIs act as retailers. The project uses an incentive approach aimed at (i) helping DBE developing a new business line involving wholesaling of MSE subsidiary loans and provision of related technical support to participating MFIs; and (ii) helping the MFIs build up a high quality MSE loan portfolio based on credit techniques that have been developed and validated under successful micro and small loan programs in other countries, introduced through downscaling or up scaling approaches to micro finance. The programmer works with service providers promoting entrepreneurship development (financial, non-financial, public, private, associative, freelance etc.) and builds their capacity to better support women entrepreneurs to start and grow their businesses. It also works towards creating a more positive enabling environment for WED, by supporting assessments of the situation, and working with governments and policy makers to remove the specific gender barriers that women entrepreneurs may face through the economic empowerment of women, it aims to contribute to greater gender equality, as well as to more job creation and economic development.

### 4.1.2 Financial and Non-financial Outreach Services provided by Vision Fund Micro Finance Institution, WEDP

As per the information obtained from the Key Informants through Interviews Vision Fund Micro Finance Institution, WEDP provides financial as well as non-financial services to the active poor. The financial services delivered by WEDP are lending and saving services. The non-financial services provided by the company are training, orientation service as well as monitoring and supervision.

## I. Financial Outreach Service

Vision fund WEDP project delivers different financial services such as lending, saving and insurance services. The target clients eligible for its services are the active poor who are willing to engage in income generating activities of their own in rural and urban areas of the country (WEDEP, 2019). As mentioned earlier WEDP provides its services using mostly the group-based methodology. Each self-selected group, which is a central unit of WEDP operation, contains three to seven members including their leader. What is more the center has been serving as a core body of clients to make a manageable and direct link with the institution. The center leader is the main contact person to the credit officers through which direct link is made with the institution. As the
groups are self-selected, members are expected to know each other, have similar background, enjoy trust and develop confidence. Given that group members are jointly responsible for the loan, they will take the risk if one of the group members fails to repay the loan. Besides, cooperative and individual based lending methodologies are lately introduced in to the system. The cooperative based loan requires physical asset or capital as collateral. Similarly the individual loan requires property or salary of permanent employees as collateral. In fact, if the client reaches higher level of loan intake he/she will be allowed to operate individually rather than on a group basis. Loan disbursements are made at a sub-branch or branch level. However, cash collections and savings mobilization activities are carried out at the center levels.

## II. Non-Financial Outreach Services

## (a) Orientation

Other non-financial services provided by the WEDP include provision of orientation, training, monitoring and supervision. Key Informant Interview with one of the credit officer divulges that eight to ten hours orientation is regularly provided for new clients of WEDP before they join the program. The orientation deals with the services provided, criteria to be a client, method, amount of loan provided, term of loan, and some other relevant information. Business development training about marketing, record keeping, and pricing is delivered for every client on voluntary basis for a month. On -job training is delivered for the staff to build their capacity.

## (b) Training

The clients especially those engaged in group lending undergo training for about a month about entrepreneurial skills, book keeping, accounting, loan deposits and administration. The training helps the clients to appreciate what is expected of them with their loans like optimum exploitation of loan use, savings, deposits and loan repayment. Before the initial loan is disbursed, all clients must attend some training which explains the rules of membership, savings requirement and penalties for late payment. In addition, the training will keep going for every six months to equip clients with the necessary tools and knowledge.

## (c) Monitoring and Supervision

The organization aspires to be able to have a successful and default free clients. Subsequently WEDP Micro Finance Institute provides a monitoring and supervision service. In fact the credit officers make assessment on whether the clients diverted the loan they have taken to another purpose or so together with this the organization open a door for helping clients designed for enhanced management of the loan money.

### 4.1.3 Outreach Performance of WEDP Micro Finance Institute

## I. The Number of Clients

In analyzing the effectiveness of microfinance in alleviating socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs, it is crucial to look at the outreaches performance of MFIs. It is argued that microfinance can play an important impact in socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs' alleviation only if the extent of outreach is reasonably large (Tsegaye, 2005). Conversely, if MFIs are restricted to only few geographical locations or serve only a small fraction of the population or the poor, their importance in socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs alleviation efforts would be limited (Mayoux, 1997). Outreach of microfinance sector can be looked at in numerous aspect among a few are the number of clients outreached and loan disbursed over the years.

WEDP is now promoting entrepreneurship development (financial, non-financial, public, private, associative, freelance etc.) and builds their capacity to better support women entrepreneurs to start and grow their businesses. It also works towards creating a more positive enabling environment for WEDP, by supporting assessments of the situation, and working with governments and policy makers to remove the specific gender barriers that women entrepreneurs may face through the economic empowerment of women, it aims to contribute to greater gender equality, as well as to more job creation and economic development.

## II. Loan Term

Loan Term: In relation to loan terms, a key informant interview with the WEDP manager in Addis Ababa branch avowed that they are established at different levels for different activities with maximum loan period being two year i.e. loans are extended for a maximum duration of 24 months.

Loan terms are related with maturity of enterprise for which loan is used. Furthermore, the minimum loan term established by WEDP is six months only.

### 4.2. Descriptions of Characteristics of Sample Clients

This section discusses the characteristics of sample respondents by applying descriptive statistics such as mean, standard deviation, percentages, and frequency. Inferential statistics such as Chi square test (for categorical variables) and t-test (for continuous variables) are used for the two groups of sample respondents (program participants and non-participants) so as to compare them with respect to some socio-economic, institutional and other characteristics that will shed light on the estimation of impact using PSM technique.

Table 1: General characteristics of beneficiaries

| S. <br> No. | Variables |  | Description | Frequency | Percentage |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Age | Treatment Client | 20-30 | 25 | 25 |
|  |  |  | 31-40 | 45 | 45 |
|  |  |  | 41-50 | 15 | 15 |
|  |  |  | 51-60 | 10 | 10 |
|  |  |  | 60 and above | 5 | 5 |
|  |  | Control <br> Client | 20-30 | 29 | 24.16 |
|  |  |  | 31-40 | 50 | 41.66 |
|  |  |  | 41-50 | 24 | 20 |
|  |  |  | 51-60 | 12 | 10 |
|  |  |  | 60 and above | 5 | 4.17 |
| 2 | Gender | Treatment Client | Male | - | - |
|  |  |  | Female | 100 | 100 |
|  |  | Control <br> Client | Male | - | - |
|  |  |  | Female | 120 | 100 |
| 3 |  |  | Elementary level (1-8 grade) | 20 | 20 |


|  | Educational status | Treatment Client | High school level (9-12 grade) | 30 | 30 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | Diploma and above | 10 | 10 |
|  |  |  | No formal education | 40 | 40 |
|  |  | Control <br> Client | Elementary level (1-8 grade) | 34 | 28 |
|  |  |  | High school level (9-12 grade) | 27 | 22 |
|  |  |  | Diploma and above | 5 | 5 |
|  |  |  | No formal education | 54 | 45 |
| 4 | Marital <br> status | Treatment <br> Client | Single | 20 | 20 |
|  |  |  | Married | 60 | 60 |
|  |  |  | Divorced | 15 | 15 |
|  |  |  | Widowed | 5 | 5 |
|  |  | Control <br> Client | Single | 25 | 21 |
|  |  |  | Married | 66 | 55 |
|  |  |  | Divorced | 23 | 19 |
|  |  |  | Widowed | 6 | 5 |

## Source; survey result, 2019

### 4.2.1. Age

With regard to the age of treatment group respondents, $25 \%$ of respondents were in the age group 20 to 30 years, $45 \%$ indicated being between 31to 40 years, and15\% in the age group 41-50, 10\% in the age group 51-60 and $10 \%$ were in the age group 60 years and above. This means that a greater number of respondents were between 31-40 years. As this study indicates majority of $45 \%$ of WEDP loan beneficiaries are on are on this highest productivity age category (31-40) within congruent with the fact that microfinance gives due attention to beneficiaries who are productive income generating business.

With regard to the age of control group respondents, 24.16 \% of respondents were in the age group 20 to 30 years, $41.66 \%$ indicated being between 31 to 40 years, and $20 \%$ in the age group 41-50,
$10 \%$ in the age group 51-60 and $4.17 \%$ were in the age group 60 years and above. This means that a greater number of respondents were between 31-40 years. As this study indicates majority of $52 \%$ of WEDP loan beneficiaries are on are on this highest productivity age category (30-45) within congruent with the fact that microfinance gives due attention to beneficiaries who are productive income generating business.

### 4.2.2. Gender

Due to the fact that WEDP loan product tailored to women entrepreneurs, all $100 \%$ of both treatment and control group respondents are found to be female.

### 4.2.3. Educational status

With respect to educational background of treatment group respondents shown in table 1.2, $5 \%$ of respondents have diploma and above qualification while $30 \%$ attended high school grade 10, whereas $15 \%$ attended elementary school or grades $1-8$. However, the remaining $40 \%$ of the respondents doesn't have any formal education. Therefore, the majority of the respondents attended at least basic literacy skill.

As the third item of table 1.2 indicates $4.1 \%$ of the control client respondents have diploma and above qualification while 22.07 \% attended high school grade $9-12$, whereas $28.3 \%$ attended elementary school or grades $1-8$. However, the remaining $45.3 \%$ of the respondents doesn't have any formal education. Therefore, the majority of the respondents attended at least basic literacy skill.

### 4.2.4. Marital status

With regard to the marital status of treatment clients, $20 \%$ of respondents were single, about $60 \%$ married, $5 \%$ widow, whereas $15 \%$ divorced. This indicates that there are a high number of married entrepreneurs which may result in favorable working ground for women entrepreneurs to get financial and non-financial support from their partners.

With regard to the marital status of control group clients, $21 \%$ of respondents were single, about $55 \%$ married, $5 \%$ widow, whereas $19 \%$ divorced. This indicates that there are a high number of married entrepreneurs which may result in favorable working ground for women entrepreneurs to get financial and non-financial support from their partners.

### 4.2.5. Family size

Table 2: Family size of the WEDP Loan beneficiaries

| S no. | Variable | Range | Frequency | Percent |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :---: | :--- |
|  Family size $1-3$ <br> 68 30.8  <br>   $4-5$ <br>   90 | $6-8$ | 40.8 |  |  |
|  |  | 9 and above | 1 | 27.5 |

Source: survey result, 2019
In this study the family size was defined as the number of people who live together permanently. Accordingly, $30.8 \%$ respondents have one up to three, $40.8 \%$ have between four up to five, whereas $27.5 \%$ have between six and eight and $0.9 \%$ had nine and above. About $69 \%$ of the respondents have four and above family size. Hence, it can be infer that most of the respondents have large family size.

### 4.2.6. Source of income

As Bateman and Chang (2012) indicate microfinance targets on providing microcredit service to the poor segment of the society, enabling them to run their own business and generate income and defeat socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs.

Figure 1: Occupation Nature of WEDP beneficiaries


Source: own survey result, 2019
According to figure 1, all (100\%) of beneficiaries have their own small business. Hence, the above study result indicates that WEDP loan beneficiaries are engaged in their own income generating activities.

## 4.3: Source of loan before taking WEDP loan

Table 3: source of loan

| Source of credit | Number of respondents | Percentage |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Private money lenders | 45 | 45 |
| Relatives or friends | 21 | 21 |
| Equib/ iddir | 7 | 7 |
| No means | 27 | 27 |

## Source: own survey, 2019

As Table 3 shows, before getting the loan from VFMFI, 17 percent of respondents were using private money lenders as their source of credit while 21 percent depended on relatives and friends. Equib and Idir constituted as the credit source for 6 percent of the clients while 57 percent of the respondents did not have any source of credit before joining WEDP program. The above figures indicate that the majority of the respondents lacked a means of credit before they joined the WEDP loan program.

## 4.4: The Impact of WEDP loan on Economic welfare of beneficiaries

### 4.4.1 Income

According to Khandker (1999), when the income of beneficiaries enhances saving and educational asset it ensures household economic security and basic needs. Moreover, the effect of the service from Microfinance is first seen on income and employment. It is after this that it can be diversified to consumption, nutrition and education.

Figure 2: Income trend of WEDP beneficiaries before and after taking the loan


Source; own survey, 2019

From the above figure 2, it is evident that the income of beneficiaries showed an increment after they join the WEDP program as it indicated that $25 \%$ of them have 101-233.29\% income increment, whereas $38.8 \%$ show $50-100 \%$ increment. However the income of $20 \%$ percent of the beneficiaries remained the same and 3.3 \% of them showed a decrease in their income.

This could mean that the WEDP loan service has positive and significance relating to the improved income of beneficiaries.

Based on the focus group discussion data, participants comparing their past and present livelihood, many of them said that they have progressed in their income, children educational conditions, business management and social performance.

A 38 years old client Woyinshet say the following
"Today, thanks to WEDP loan, I sell cold beer and my income has improved."(FGD)

This is the opinion of one of the participants of focus group discussion who was selling not cold beer as she was not able to buy refrigerant before she joined the WEDP program. This beneficiary said that not having a television in her house was affecting her business and income. But now she said that people are happy to stay longer in her house and as the result her income is enhanced.

A 35 years old client Bekelech say the following:
"When I first joined WEDP program, I was working on a business of baking and reselling of injera for households. But due to the loan, my capital has increased and enabled me to expand my job to supply the product to hotels and keep extra money as saving. And also I attended a school in the department of food preparation and management." (FGD)

The above result revealed that there is a positive contribution of WEDP program in the growth on income conditions of the beneficiaries and also growth on the saving habits.

### 4.4.2. Saving

According to Chalchisa 2006, saving scheme is related to income and aims at making the beneficiaries consumption smooth and enables them to pay back their loan. Moreover, there are voluntary and mandatory way of saving developed and managed by financial institutions.

Figure 3: Saving trend of WEDP beneficiaries


## Source: secondary data from VFMFI

As the above graph indicates, the amount of voluntarily saving in Birr (ETB) $13.3 \%$ of beneficiaries achieved to save 801-2658, $7.5 \%$ saved between $401-800$, whereas $15 \%$ of respondents saved between 201-400 and 64.16\% of respondents saved between 29-200. This type of saving is based on full will of beneficiaries and beneficiaries are free to save and withdraw it at any time.

As saving habit of beneficiaries is concerned, they are fully aware of the benefits of saving and are in the state of implementing it. From the respondents addressed using a questionnaire $30 \%$ of them expressed that they use their saved money to promote business and create other business works. The other $32.5 \%$ expressed that they use the saved money as a guarantee in case of health problems and other family problems. The other $9.17 \%$ use the saved money for purchasing school materials for their children and buying household materials. The other $26.6 \%$ expressed that they have no particular immediate plans, but they are simply content with the growth of their saved money when important necessities come into their life, the remaining $1.6 \%$ failed to give a response. This shows the time by time growth in awareness and practices of saving on the part of the beneficiaries. This in turn is believed to promote their business works and can serve as a guarantee in time of unexpected risks.

### 4.4.3: Use of WEDP Loan

Table 4: Percentage distribution of the sample by purpose for which loan is used

| S.no | Frequency | Frequency | Percentage |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1 | Purchase of consumption items for <br> home | 20 | 17 |
| 2 | Purchase of materials for the small <br> business and trade | 100 | 83 |
|  | Total | 120 | 100 |

Source; own survey, 2019
As can be seen from Table 4, only 17 percent of the respondents used the credit money for the purchase of food items while the rest 83 percent use the funds for small business and trade. Hence, WEDP loan has enabled the women to engage in small businesses.

The FGD also indicated that almost all of the clients utilize the money for business purposes. Some respondents used the loan to prepare and sell Injera, Ambasha. (local bread). A few of them utilized the money to buy lakech mitad. (a type of flat stove made of clay used to prepare injera). Some prepare Baltena. (food items) such as Berbere. (hot pepper), Shiro (powdered beans), Mitmita. (hot bend of pepper and spices), etc. for sale. Others build houses in their compounds for rent. Furthermore, some engage in the sale of vegetable, fruits, coal etc. in the Gullit. (a small commodity market).

A 29 years old single woman who is a mother of one describes the situation as follows.
"I use the WEDP loan to buy and sell vegetables in the gullit. Although I am not able to make profits, the business has enabled me to support my child and myself. "(FGD)

From the above results, we can see that the majority of the clients are engaged in economic activities that offer self-employment. Therefore, the result of the study confirms that WDEP loan play a role in enhancing the economic production capabilities and social well-being of poor women and their household.

## 4.5: The impact of WEDP Loan on human capital aspect

4.5.1 Training participation before taking the loan

Table 5: Training participation of WEDP beneficiaries

| Item | Attending training | Frequency | Percentage |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | Yes | 120 | 100 |
|  | NO | 0 | 0 |

In terms of training, $100 \%$ of respondents had been trained in business development and management, basic short computational and skills training, conflict resolution among centers \& groups.

### 4.5.2. Outcomes of trainings

Figure 4: outcome of training for WEDP beneficiaries


Source: own survey, 2019

According to the above figure regarding the outcomes of training, the result indicates $58.7 \%$ have improved business management capacity, including managing to record daily sales and the cost of materials or goods. Whereas $34.8 \%$ of respondents developed better customer handling and as the result have more customers and $6.5 \%$ confirmed that they have a better understanding of conflict management. This could mean that the training made respondents beneficial by different aspects and the large number of the figure goes to business related benefit.

As the results of the focus group discussion indicted due to the continued training the beneficiaries took they have been able to take a good experience as how to get goods from the market, how to
set their selling price and other valuable information in their market and this in turn has played a great role in their income. Hence, the WDEP loan taking methodology makes entrepreneurs to have knowledge in relation to understanding better way of managing their businesses.

### 4.5.3. Educational Conditions of Children

Services provided to beneficiaries are believed to promote the educational status of children. In a study by Chowdhury and Bhuiya (2004) as cited in Fleke (2011) from Bangladesh it is observed that there is a better educational performance of children after beneficiaries joined the Microfinance institution.

Table 6: School enrolment of WEDP beneficiaries' Children

| School enrollment of Kids | Number of <br> respondents | Remark |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Attend only this time | 2 | Inability to afford school materials and fee <br>  <br> Quit this time awareness of the parents |
| Never attended | - |  |
| Have always been attending | 97 | Lack of interest |

Source: own survey, 2019
NB. The remaining 30 respondents do not have children at all or their children are not in school age.

According to table 6, the school enrolment data 2 and 1 respondents have replied their children attend school only this time and quite this time responses respectively. The main problem was due to lack of awareness on the side of parents and inability to afford school materials before they join in the program. However, the majority, 97 respondents reflected that always their children attend a school.

Though the rate of children school enrollment showed no difference, whereas the focus group discussion result shows that, due to the institutions, awareness raising program principally focuses on education, beneficiaries have more awareness, they are affording better school materials to children, and overall they become supportive on their children education after they joined to the program than before. Besides, the children of the beneficiaries have invested their time in helping the business in a way that doesn't interfere with their education.

A 40 years old client Shewaye say the following
"I am not letting my children anymore to be absent from school, my social inclusion has improved and I have got much experience from my group members, how aware they are on the education of their children" (FGD)

This is a say one participant remembering the time that she was letting her children to take care on the business while she attains some social events outside the home.

And another participant, 38 years old client, also explained her experience by saying,
"Currently, due to the good income I generate from my market I am able to buy the materials my children need for their school, but previously I used to feel embarrassed when the children asked me to buy them the necessary materials for their school. Currently I and my children are content with our lives." (FGD)

Besides, as the result from the focus group discussion indicates the income of the beneficiaries has shown a considerable growth through time. Yet, the children of the beneficiaries invest their time in helping the business in a way that doesn't interfere with their education.

### 4.5.4 Decisions on Credit

Table 7: Responsibility for decisions on Credit

|  | Decision maker | Frequency | Percent |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $\mathbf{1}$ | Myself alone | 79 | 65.7 |
| $\mathbf{2}$ | My husband and myself together | 41 | 33.8 |
|  | Total |  |  |

In Table 7, 65.7 percent of the respondents manage and make decisions by themselves alone on the loan they receive from Vision fund Micro finance institution. The loan is handled jointly with the husband for 33.8 percent of the respondents. This shows that the decisions pertaining to the loan secured from Vision fund Micro finance institution are made either by the women alone or jointly with the husband.
The results of the focus group discussion also showed a similar situation as to the role of the wife and the husband in such decisions. Those who decide by themselves gave two reasons for this. The first one is that some clients do not tell their membership and loans taken to the husbands for fear that the latter might stop giving them money for household expenditure. Hence, the WEDP clients use the money by themselves.

The response of a 41 years old woman noted the following.
"I even did not tell my husband that I took loan from Vision Fund micro finance institution. This was for fear that he would stop providing money for the household expenses.

In the second case, the husband knows about the loan but he is not involved in taking the loan, its repayment as well as managing or utilizing the money.
A 30 years old lady states that
"My husband knows that I use the money secured through MFI to support the family. He basically has no say on the money. I decide on the money and hold sole responsibility for the repayment.

On the other hand, there are cases where the husband fully participates in the taking and repayment of the loan as well as the management and decision about it.

A 30 years old woman explained as follows;
"We discuss and jointly decide on all issues. I joined the MFI with his full agreement and jointly decide on the money. We also share the responsibility of debt repayment.

This shows that the credit is utilized and managed either by the wife alone or jointly by the wife and husband but not only by the husband. We can also see that those who do not tell about the loan to the husband have two dimensions. One is for household purposes as some believe that their husbands would refuse to allocate money for household expenditure once the wife becomes a member of Vision Fund Micro Finance institution. The other dimension is that, as the husband is also required to settle the loan, problems might occur in the family if the wife does not manage to pay back the money taken.

Two important points can be inferred from the above results. First, the fact that women make sole or joint decisions on the use of incomes generated through microfinance is a good start point for their empowerment. Secondly, women that do not tell their involvement in Vision Fund micro finance to their husbands might encounter family problems in the event they fail to repay their debts.

## 4.6 : Impacts of WEDP loan program on household and Social level

According to empowerment paradigm, empowerment also needs to deal with change in intrahousehold relations. Thus, this part deals with the impact of WEDP loan on gender relations at the household level. It includes the women's decision making power, the value and money expenditure of the husband.

### 4.6.1 Cash Expenditure of the Husband

Table 8: cash expenditure of the husband

| Husband expenditure | Before WEDP loan |  | After WEDP loan |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | No of of <br> respondents | Percentage | No <br> respondents | Percentage |
| Spend for family purpose | 30 | 30 | 26 | 26 |
| Spend more for personal <br> use (cloth, drinking <br> liquors | 15 | 15 | 21 | 21 |
| Doesn't have a job | 19 | 19 | 16 | 16 |
| Those who do not have <br> spouse | 36 | 36 | 37 | 37 |

Source: own survey, 2019

Table 4.8 shows that the husband spends for family purposes in the case of 30.3 percent and 26 percent of the respondents, respectively, before and after taking WEDP loan from Vision Fund

Micro finance institution. The personal expenditure of the husband has also increased for 21 percent of the respondents after they took loan although the figure previously stood at 14 percent. 16 percent and 18.8 percent of the respondents' husbands, respectively, do not have jobs after and before they took the loan. The rest 37 percent of them do not have spouse before and after joining WEDP PROGRAM. This shows that the husband's expenditure for family purpose has decreased and expenditure for personal use has increased after the wife became a member of MFI.
A 31 years old client stated the following during the FGD.
"My husband continues to provide money for household use both before and after I joined the MFI (FGD).

Others said that the husband sometimes gives money and at times does not because of temporary work and other reasons both before and after joining the WEDP PROGRAM.

A 36 years old woman who is a mother of four children noted the following.
"My husband may or may not provide money for household use as he wishes. He rarely gives me money particularly after I joined the MFI. He is usually short of money because he drinks a lot. After I joined the MFI, my dependence on him became less. I support the family with the incomes I earn and no more depend on him."

They further explained that before joining MFI it was very difficult for them to sustain the family if the husband could not supply money for household expenditure.
A woman of 31 years of age noted that
"My husband has been laid off from his job and he works as a daily laborer when he finds one. We were in a difficult situation before I joined Vision Fund micro finance but we are now relatively better and have at least something to eat."
However, the fear decreases and the family can somehow sustain without the husband's support after the respondents joined MFI. The problem here is that the husband intends to use the money, which was earlier supplied for household expenditure, for personal use after the women join MFI and earn income.

A 30 years old woman stated the following.
"My husband used to provide money for household use before I joined WEDP PROGRAM. However, he stopped this after my participation and now keeps his income for personal use. I am able to support the family but with great difficulties"

We can infer from the above explanation that the wife can now better support the family after joining MFI regardless of whether the husband gives money for household hold purposes. Generally, it is observed that WDEP loan helped the women to improve their financial status at the household level. However, the women would still find it hard to support the family by themselves while the husband ceases to supply money for the household.

### 4.6.2 Husband Value to Women's Contribution

Table 9: The value of husband's to Women's contribution

| Husband's <br> value | Before of WEDP loan |  | After WEDP <br> loan |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | Number of <br> respondents | Percent | Number of <br> respondents | Percent |
| Appreciation | 23 | 18.8 | 26 | 21.4 |
| Keeps quite | 37 | 31.1 | 32 | 27.1 |
| No appreciation | 16 | 13.4 | 18 | 14.7 |
| Those who do <br> not have spouse | 44 | 36.7 | 44 | 36.7 |
| Total | 120 | 100 | 120 | 100 |

Table 9 shows that 21.4 percent of the respondents have been appreciated by their husbands after joining taking WDEP loan while the figure previously stood at 18.8 percent. 27.1 percent and 31.1 percent of the husbands took the client's contribution as normal after and before joining MFI respectively. 14.7 percent of the husbands have despised the contribution of their wives to the family after joining MFI whereas it was 13.4 percent prior to joining MFI. 36.7 percent of the clients do not have a spouse before and after joining of MFI.

The number of husbands who respect the wife for the contribution made to the household has increased after joining MFI. At the same time the number of husbands who act differently has increased after joining MFI. However, the number of husbands who take the activities performed by the wife as normal has decreased after joining MFI.

Different views have been observed when the participants of the FGD were asked about the value given by the husband to their constitution to the household. Some respondents said that they have been appreciated by the husband before and after joining MFI.

A 30 years old woman noted that
"My husband appreciates my contribution made to the household after I joined the MFI (FGD).
Some of them have said that the husbands appreciate their contribution because they have seen the impact on the household. Others the husband appreciated their contribution in performing household activities because he stopped giving money for the family use.
A 33 years old lady said the following.
"My husband is happy with the contribution I make to the household from the money I earned through MFI. This is because he can now use his earning for personal enjoyment.
Others said that the husband, especially after the wives join MFI, become unhappy for fear of being dominated by this wife and feel inferiority when the wife does something for the family which the husband did not do before. Hence, they give less or no value to the wife's contribution to the household.

The following is the reply from another participant whose age is 28
"My husband dislikes my contribution to the household as he feels excelled by me."
A similar feedback was given by another woman age of 37
"My husband would prefer to suffer from money shortages rather than seeing the family's life improved through my contribution."

These respondents said that they are uncomfortable with contributing to their homes due complaints made by the husband.
The following 30 years old woman brings in yet another view.
My husband takes my contribution as normal; he is neither happy nor sad about it. He basically shows no reaction on the contribution made to the household from the money secured from MFI (FGD)."

This shows that there are husbands who appreciate, despise or take as normal the contribution of the wife to the home. As we can see in the table, the number of husbands that appreciate the women's contribution has increased after the latter joined the MFI.

However, the cause of appreciation is not always the contribution to the household by itself but in some cases it is because the husband is relieved from providing money to the household. On the
other hand, those women that are despised by the husband are not comfortable with making the contribution to the household. The above indicates that although WEDP loan improves the contribution of women to the household, it has not enhanced the values given by the husband to their roles. We even see a declining trend in this regard because the husband does want to be excelled by the wife. This is generally one of the consequences of a patriarchal society.

### 4.6.3 Household Decision Making

Table 10: participation in household decision making

| Role in decision | Before taking WEDP loan |  |  | After taking WEDP loan |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :---: |
| Fully participation | 19 | 15.8 | 20 | 16.6 |  |
| Occasionally (partially) | 39 | 32.4 | 38 | 31.9 |  |
| Rarely | 17 | 14.7 | 18 | 14.7 |  |
| Those who do not have <br> spouse | 44 | 37 | 44 | 36.7 |  |
|  | 120 | 100 | 120 | 100 |  |

Table 10 shows that 15.8 percent and 16.6 percent of the respondents fully participate in household decisions before and after joining MFI, respectively. 32.4 percent and 31.9 percent have partial/occasional decision making says before and after MFI respectively. 14.7 percent of them rarely have decision making power before and after joining WEDP program. The remaining 36.7 percent of respondents are those do not have spouse. Full participation in decision making at household level has increased as partial and occasional decision making decrease and rarely decision making power at household level remain the same before and after starting relationship with VFMFI. Household decision making levels are almost the same before and after joining MFI. The majority of the respondents have indicated that their decision making powers have remained the same before and after they joined the Vision Fund micro finance institution.

A 30 years old woman noted the following.
"We make decisions jointly both before and after I joined the MFI. There are no changes in this regard (FGD)."
The following is the reply from a 50 years old participant.
"I only participate in decisions regarding the use of money secured through MFI. All other decisions are solely made by him (FGD)."

A 28 years old lady described the situation as follows.
"My husband somewhat involves me on decisions relating to our children. Otherwise, he is the one who decides on all issues before and after I have been member of MFI."

The above findings indicate husbands hold most decision making powers both before and after the women joined the MFI. MFI helped the women to enhance their economic status and made decision on using the loan to their family but made no significant change on their decision making power on other issues at the household level. Hence, MFI has failed to bring about changes in gender relations on the decision making power except with regards to the loans secured. However, the fact that some participate in household decisions by using the loan is a positive step towards their empowerment.

### 4.6.4 Participation in Traditional Institutions

Table 11: participation in traditional institutions

| Traditional <br> Institutions | Before taking WEDP loan |  |  | After taking WEDP loan |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :---: |
|  | Frequency | Percent | Frequency | Percent |  |
| Equib | 16.08 | 13.4 | 16.08 | 13.4 |  |
| Idir | 64.32 | 53.6 | 64.32 | 53.6 |  |
| Mahiber | 39.60 | 33 | 39.6 | 33.0 |  |
| Total | 120 | 100 | 120 | 100 |  |

As shown in Table 11, the percentage of respondents that participate in equib is 13.4 percent before and after joining MFI. 53.6 percent of respondents are participating in Idir. The rest 33 percent are participating in Mahiber. All respondents are participating at least in one institution before and after joining MFI

The FGD indicated that all of the participants are a member of at least one traditional institution idir (a community savings club for the eventuality of a death or marriage in the community),
mahber (an association in which a group of people organize monthly feasts in the name of a particular patron saint in turns or an association of mutual help), Iquib (a rotating saving and credit group). Both before and after they joined the WEDP PROGRAM, the women engage in community services such as participating in funeral processions, weddings, visiting the sick and paying last respect to the dead. They would risk alienation if they fail to participate in the above occasions. Therefore, the result implies that WDEP loan program doesn't change the participation and involvement of women in social institutions.

### 4.6.5: Ownership of asset

Table 12: ownership of asset

| Characteristics | Before taking WEDP loan |  | After taking WEDP loan |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | Frequency | Percent | Frequency | Percent |
| High | 15 | 12.9 | 15 | 12.9 |
| Medium | 40 | 32.7 | 40 | 32.7 |
| Poor | 20 | 17.7 | 22 | 17.7 |
| Those who do not have <br> spouse | 44 | 36.7 | 44 | 36.7 |
| Total | 120 | 100 | 120 | 100 |

Table 12 indicates that the percentage of respondents that has achieved the right to jointly own household asset 12.9 percent before and after taking WDEP loan. Respondents with partial joint ownership rights 32.7 percent before and after taking WDEP loan. Furthermore, the percentage of respondents that remained without any ownership rights 17.7 percent before and after joining taking WDEP loan. 36.7 percent of the respondents are those who do not have spouse before and after taking WDEP loan.

As shown above, it appears that the percentage of respondents that managed to secure their joint asset ownership rights remained the same despite the participation in WDEP loan.

### 4.6.6: Self-confidence of WDEP clients

As indicated under the review of literature, self-confidence and self-esteem are potential results of empowerment. Cheston and Kuhn (2002) identified self-confidence as one of the most crucial areas for empowerment. We will here below look into the effects of WEDP PROGRAM participation in enhancing the client's self-confidence.

Table 13: level of self-image of WDEP beneficiaries

| Level of self - <br> confidence | Before taking WEDP loan |  |  | After taking WEDP loan |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :---: |
|  | Frequency | Percent | Frequency | Percent |  |
| Very High | 70 | 58.6 | 91 | 75.6 |  |
| Less important | 41 | 34.1 | 25 | 21.7 |  |
| I do not know | 9 | 7.3 | 4 | 2.7 |  |
| Total | 120 | 100 | 120 | 100 |  |

Table 13 shows, after joining MFI, 75.6 of the respondents have a feel of importance as compared to 58.6 percent before participating in the MFI. 21.7 and 34.1 percent feel less important, respectively, after and before joining MFI. On the other hand, 2.7 and 5 percent do not really know their feeling about themselves, respectively, after and before joining MFI. The self-confidence of the women has generally improved after they joined the MFI.
It appears that from the replies of the FGD their self-confidence and value toward themselves has enhanced after the intervention of microfinance.

A 28 years old lady who is single said the following.
"The fact that I now engage in some sort of business has itself enhanced my self-confidence (FGD)."

The following has been noted by a 46 years old widow.
"I am encouraged with the changes brought about in my family after I joined the MFI." This gives the confidence that I can work and improve my living. (FGD).

A 33 years old client had this to say.
"Previously I was financially dependent on my husband. My confidence has improved because I now have my own income."

A 35 years old lady respondent stated that, "Although my husband is not happy with the contribution I make to the household, my selfconfidence has increased because I have realized that I can work and become economically independent (FGD)."

All in all, the self-confidence of most of the women has enhanced after their participation in WDEP loan. This is a very basic requirement of empowerment as the women would be encouraged to work hard and improve their lives as their self-confidence enhances.

### 4.7 Types of the business clients are engaged in

Most of the respondents (53.64\%) engaged in the food and drinks business and worked in cooked food vending businesses followed by small petty trading business (27.73\%), textile sales (6.36\%), hair salon (5.45\%) and Metal work (3.18\%). Others (3.64\%) including tailoring, home furniture making and retailer of telephone cards (Table 17). A possible explanation for why microentrepreneurs concentrated in food business and small petty trading could be because the needed startup capital for this business is relatively low and its market opportunity. That means micro entrepreneurs can easily secure initial capital from personal savings, friends and relatives. Additionally, low income earner want to involve themselves in business ventures such as home based enterprises, which will allow them enough time to attend to other household activities like keeping children's under five at home and cooking food to the family.

Table 14 Type Business respondents Engaged

| Business type or | Treatment |  | Control |  | Total |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| occupation | Frequency | $\%$ | Frequency | $\%$ | Frequency | $\%$ |
| Food \& drink | 46 | 46.0 | 72 | 60.00 | 99 | 53.64 |
| vending |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Small business | 34 | 34.0 | 27 | 22.50 | 51 | 27.73 |
| Textile Sales | 6 | 6.0 | 8 | 6.67 | 13 | 6.36 |
| Hair Salon | 5 | 5.0 | 7 | 5.83 | 11 | 5.45 |
| Metal Work | 4 | 4.0 | 3 | 2.50 | 7 | 3.18 |
| Others | 5 | 5.0 | 3 | 2.50 | 6 | 3.64 |
| Total | $\mathbf{1 0 0}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 . 0}$ | $\mathbf{1 2 0}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 . 0}$ | $\mathbf{2 2 0}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 . 0}$ |

Source: Own survey result, 2019

### 4.8 Econometric Results

This part describes the whole process of deriving the impact of microfinance on socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs' activity. It explains the estimation of propensity scores, matching methods, common support region, balancing test and sensitivity analysis. It also explains the treatment effect of the intervention across the participating clients.

The logistic regression model was used to estimate propensity score matching for treatment and control client households. As, indicated earlier, the dependent variable is binary that indicate households' participation decision in the microfinance services. Results presented in Table 18 shows the estimated model appears to perform well for the intended matching exercise. The pseudo- $\mathrm{R}^{2}$ value is 0.376 . A fairly low R 2 value shows that program households do not have much distinct characteristics overall and as such finding a good match between treatment and control clients becomes easier.

The pseudo- R2 indicates how well the regresses explain the participation probability. After matching there should be no systematic differences in the distribution of covariates between both groups and therefore, the pseudo- $\mathrm{R}^{2}$ should be fairly low (Caliendo and Kopeinig, 2008).

The results in Table 18 are generally unsurprising and reveal a number of significant covariates of program participation. The probability of a client's participating in microfinance tends to increase with sex being female, individual with married and hold family responsibility, large household size, self-employed or casual occupation, with household ability to save and decrease with the age, educational level and dependency ratio. Sex, family size and dependency ratio were all not statistically significant. This means that there is no relation between sex, family size and dependency ratio with participation in microfinance services.

Looking at the result for the logit estimated sample in table 18 the intercept ( 0.755 ) is positive and significant, showing that the microfinance has positive impact on the reduction of poverty. Eight variables were hypothesized to explain factors affecting participation in microfinance. Out of these five of the variables were found to be statistically significant at least at $5 \%$ while the three were less significant in explaining the variations in the dependent variable.

The maximum likelihood estimates of the logistic regression model show that age, marital status, educational level, savings of client and income of clients are important factors influencing access to participation in microfinance in the study area (Table 18).

Table 15: Logit results of client's program participation

| Participation | Coefficients | Std. Err. | Z | p-value |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :---: |
| Age | $0.0419^{* *}$ | 0.0164 | 2.54 | 0.011 |  |
| Sex | 0.2506 | 0.4551 | 0.55 | 0.582 |  |
| Marital status | $0.9104^{* * *}$ | 0.2582 | 3.53 | 0.000 |  |
| Education level | $-0.1139^{* *}$ | 0.0546 | -2.08 | 0.037 |  |
| Family size | -0.0484 | 0.2110 | -0.23 | 0.818 |  |
| Dependency ratio | 0.2813 | 0.2301 | 1.22 | 0.221 |  |
| Saving of Client | $-0.1696^{* * *}$ | 0.0307 | -5.51 | 0.000 |  |
| Income of Client | $0.0605^{* * *}$ | 0.0108 | 5.58 | 0.000 |  |
| Constant | $0.7550^{* *}$ | 0.2425 | 3.11 | 0.027 |  |
| LR chi2 (8) $=114.04$ <br> Pseudo R2 $=0.376$ |  |  |  |  |  |

Source: Model Result, 2019.
Again it is important to emphasis that all the variables with weak predictive ability included in the logit regression can be still helpful to minimize bias in estimating casual effect in propensity score matching, since the ultimate goal is to not to predict selection in to treatment but to balance covariates and get closer to the observationally identical non participants.

Looking into the estimated coefficients (table 18), the results indicate that participation in microfinance is significantly influenced by five explanatory variables. Education level and savings of clients are found to have strong and positive relationship with client's participation in the microfinance. The level of significance is at $1 \%$ for marital status, saving of client and income of clients, $5 \%$ for age and educational level. By contrast age, marital status and income of client has a strong and negative effect on household participation in microfinance service at 5\%, $1 \%$ and $1 \%$ significant level respectively.

### 4.9 Propensity score

The result of the logistic regression model is used to estimate propensity scores for matching treatment client with control client. As indicated earlier, the dependent variable in this model is a binary variable indicating whether the client was a participant in the microfinance. The model is estimated with Stata 14 computing software using the propensity scores matching algorithm developed by Leuven and Sianesi (2003). In the estimation data from the two groups; namely, treatment and control client were pooled such that the dependent variable takes a value 1 if the household was treatment client (in the program) and 2 otherwise.

Propensity score matching is a way to "correct" the estimation of treatment effects controlling for the existence of these confounding factors based on the idea that the bias is reduced when the comparison of outcomes is performed using treated and control subjects who are as similar as possible. Since matching subjects on an n-dimensional vector of characteristics is typically unfeasible for large $n$, this method proposes to summarize pre-treatment characteristics of each subject into a single-index variable (the propensity score) which makes the matching feasible (Shadure, 2009).

The extent to which this bias is reduced depends crucially on the richness and quality of the control variables on which the propensity score is computed and the matching performed. To be more precise, the bias is eliminated only if the exposure to treatment can be considered to be purely random among individuals who have the same value of the propensity score. The propensity score matching (PSM) model were employed to estimate income improvement effects of access to MFIs and loans used for productive business purposes. This model compensates for endogenous binary treatment effects or sample selection bias associated with access to MFIs. Despite some limitations e.g. arising from the unobservable of potentially important determinants of participation in microfinance program, significantly positive effects of MFI access on the multidimensional welfare indicator were confirmed by the model, a result which suggests that MFIs play a significant impact in improving income level. We found that the results from the propensity score matching model were similar to those derived by kernel matching in the PSM model (Shadure, 2009).

Propensity score matching (PSM) constructs a statistical comparison group that is based on a model of the probability of participating in the treatment, using observed characteristics. Participants are then matched on the basis of this probability, or propensity score, to
nonparticipants. The average treatment effect of the program is then calculated as the mean difference in outcomes across these two groups. The validity of PSM depends on two conditions: (a) conditional independence (namely, that unobserved factors do not affect participation) and (b) sizable common support or overlap in propensity scores across the participant and nonparticipant samples (Shadure, 2009).

Table 16: Matching Methods to Measure Impact of Microfinance in poverty reeducation

| itcome <br> Variable | Estimation Type | ATT | Std.Err | $z$-value | $p>/ z /$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Income of Clients | Inverse-probability weights | 493.31 | 116.53 | 4.23 | 0.000*** |
|  | Nearest Neighborhood | 461.633 | $\begin{aligned} & 115.33 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | 4.00 | 0.000*** |
|  | Propensity-score matching | 465.493 | $\begin{aligned} & 117.33 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | 3.97 | 0.000*** |
| Savings of Clients | Inverse-probability weights | 155.06 | 38.93 | 3.98 | 0.000*** |
|  | Nearest Neighborhood | 143.895 | 38.567 | 3.73 | 0.000*** |
|  | Propensity-score matching | 144.66 | 39.057 | 3.70 | 0.000*** |
| Expenditure on Health | weights | 80.398 | 8.307 | 9.68 | 0.000*** |
|  | Nearest Neighborhood | 82.49 | 9.857 | 8.37 | 0.000*** |
|  | Propensity-score matching | 78.80 | 10.804 | 7.29 | 0.000*** |
| Expenditure on Children education | Inverse-probability weights | 161.112 | 16.388 | 9.83 | 0.000*** |
|  | Nearest Neighborhood | 135.77 | 29.099 | 4.67 | 0.000*** |
|  | Propensity-score matching | 166.33 | 19.204 | 8.66 | 0.000*** |

Source: Model Result, 2019.
***, **, * significant at $1 \%, 5 \%$ and $10 \%$ probability level respectively

### 4.9.1 Estimation of impact of factor influencing treatment effect (ATT) on income of the client

Table 19 presents results from the PSM model that was estimated for comparison purposes with the treatment effect model results. Three matching estimators, the inverse-probability weights, the nearest neighbor and the propensity-score matching algorithms were employed for all out come variables as robustness checks. The three estimators result indicates that microfinance has a significant impact on the income of clients. Participants got more monthly income as compared to non-participants. In this respect, the difference between participants and nonparticipants in total monthly income is significant at $1 \%$ significant level.

ATT results of these algorithms show that participation in the microfinance program increased income of the household by birr 493.31, birr 461.63 and birr 465.49 for inverse-probability weights, nearest neighborhood and propensity-score matching respectively. The average income estimated using the inverse-probability weights matching algorithm is higher than that of the other two matching algorithms. Moreover, there is a slight difference in the average monthly income difference of participant and their counter factual between the results of these algorithms and result of simple $t$-test (table 19) ranging from birr 19.04 to birr 50.72 for inverse-probability weights and nearest neighborhood matching algorithms. This indicate that, the difference revealed with these algorithms is the only difference with participation to microfinance or not and the difference between the result of these algorithms and the result of $t$-test is the difference with un observable factors. Comparing the results across the different matching methods indicate that the estimated microfinance impact is robust.

### 4.9.2 Estimation of impact of factor influencing treatment effect (ATT) on saving of the client

Table 19 shows that participants save more as compared to non-participants. The ATT result of the above three algorithms revealed that participants' saving status is significant at $1 \%$ significant level. Results show that participation in the microfinance program increased the amount of saving of the non-participant by birr 155.06, birr 143.895 and birr 144.66 based on the ATT results of Inverse-probability weights, Nearest Neighborhood and Propensity-score matching algorithms respectively. This means that
the amount of saving of treatment client is higher with these figures compared to control clients. All of these figures are smaller compared to the difference of saving between participant and non-
participant simple t-test (table 19) which is 161.19 . This indicates the robustness of the PSM method and this is the reason why the researcher choices this method.

### 4.9.3 Estimation of impact of factor influencing treatment effect (ATT) on expenditure to health

Table 19 demonstrates that participants"e expenditure on health is higher as compared to nonparticipants. This indicates that participants have an access to get health treatment for his/her household member. In this respect, the difference between participants and non-participants is significant at $1 \%$ probability level. Results show that participation in the microfinance program increased expenditure on health of the household by birr 80.398, birr 82.49 and birr 78.8 using ATT results of Inverse-probability weights, Nearest Neighborhood and Propensity-score matching algorithms respectively. The differences between these results and $t$-test result ranges from 15.66 to 19.35 for Propensity-score matching and Nearest Neighborhood respectively. Indicating the most robustness of Propensity-score matching algorithm compared to other methods and conservativeness of t-test. This difference comes from the impacts of un observable variables to the researcher. So, the difference between participant and non-participant because of microfinance participation is the result of these algorithms with the best one is the result of Propensity-score matching algorithm.

### 4.9.4 Estimation of impact of factor influencing treatment effect (ATT) on expenditure to

 children educationTable 19 reveals that participants expend more for education as compared to non-participants. In this respect, the difference between participants and non-participants is significant at $1 \%$ probability level. Results show that participation in the program increased expenditure on education of the household by birr 161.112, birr 135.77 and birr 166.63 for ATT results of Inverseprobability weights, Nearest Neighborhood and Propensity-score matching algorithms respectively. From these results, results of propensity score matching is higher indicating its conservativeness compared to other two.

## CHAPTER FIVE - SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

### 5.1 SUMMARY

The overall objective of the study was to investigate the impact of women entrepreneurship development project (WEDP) loans on the socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs in the case study of Vision Fund Micro Finance Institution, Addis Ababa branch. Therefore, the following major findings were obtained on the basis of the analysis.

- Regarding the age of respondents, a greater number of respondents were between 31-40 years.
- The study revealed that the products and services provided by WEDP is mainly targeted women who constitute $100 \%$ of their clients.
- Majority of $52 \%$ of WEDP loan beneficiaries are on are on this highest productivity age category (30-45) within congruent with the fact that microfinance gives due attention to beneficiaries who are productive income generating business.
- Since WEDP loan product tailored to women entrepreneurs, all $100 \%$ of the respondents are found to be female.
- Majority ( $45.3 \%)$ of the respondents attended at least basic literacy skill.
- It is noticed that most of the respondents and informant agreed that Vision Fund Microfinance institution, WEDP has improved the lifestyles of the poor section of the people.
- It is noticed that it has boosted economic development directly and indirectly and enhanced happiness in the household.
- Vision Fund Microfinance institution, WEDP microfinance plays a significant impact in contributing to poverty reduction by providing financial and nonfinancial services.
- To be part of the program, the client must already be involved in a business activity that can generate income for the repayment of the loan. Also, the products mostly target food and drink vending and small business.
- With regard to the marital status, there are a high number (55\%) of married entrepreneurs which may result in favorable working ground for women entrepreneurs to get financial and non-financial support from their partners.
- Most of the respondents (69\%) have of the respondents have four and above family size and it can be infer that large family size.
- The result of the study shows that the WEDP loan service has positive and significance relating to the improved income of beneficiaries.
- The result of the study revealed that there is a positive contribution of WEDP program in the growth on income conditions of the beneficiaries and also growth on the saving habits.
- The result of the study shows that the time by time growth in awareness and practices of saving on the part of the beneficiaries. This in turn is believed to promote their business works and can serve as a guarantee in time of unexpected risks.
- The result of the study shows that that the training made respondents beneficial by different aspects and the large number of the figure goes to business related benefit.
- As the results of the focus group discussion indicted due to the continued training the beneficiaries took they have been able to take a good experience as how to get goods from the market, how to set their selling price and other valuable information in their market and this in turn has played a great role in their income
- From the results of this study, we can see that the majority of the clients are engaged in economic activities that offer self-employment. Therefore, the result of the study confirms that financial services play a role in enhancing the economic production capabilities and social well-being of poor women and their household.
- The result of the study shows that the credit is utilized and managed either by the wife alone or jointly by the wife and husband but not only by the husband. We can also see that those who do not tell about the loan to the husband have two dimensions. One is for household purposes as some believe that their husbands would refuse to allocate money for household expenditure once the wife becomes a member of Vision Fund Micro Finance institution. The other dimension is that, as the husband is also required to settle the loan, problems might occur in the family if the wife does not manage to pay back the money taken.
- The result of the study shows that the wife can now better support the family after joining MFI regardless of whether the husband gives money for household hold purposes. Generally, it is observed that MFI helped the women to improve their financial status at the household level. However, the women would still find it hard to support the family by themselves while the husband ceases to supply money for the household.
- The result of the study shows that there are husbands who appreciate, despise or take as normal the contribution of the wife to the home. As we can see in the table, the number of husbands that appreciate the women's contribution has increased after the latter joined the MFI.
- The result of the study shows that although MFI improves the contribution of women to the household, it has not enhanced the values given by the husband to their roles. We even see a declining trend in this regard because the husband does want to be excelled by the wife. This is generally one of the consequences of a patriarchal society.


### 5.2 CONCLUSIONS

In this study, the survey analyzed the impact of women entrepreneurship development project (WEDP) loans on the socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs in the case study of Vision Fund Micro Finance Institution, Addis Ababa branch. The study used a comprising approach of a treated and a control group. The treated group is composed of clients who participated at least for three years, and the control group is made up of new program entrants or potential clients waiting for the service. The study applied recent advances in propensity score matching methods to assess the impact of microfinance on poverty reduction. Since a baseline survey or randomizations are not feasible options in this case, the study is well suited to matching methods. For the purposes of comparison, the study presented estimated results with treatment and control groups separately.

From the foregoing results and the summary, my study identified the impact of women entrepreneurship development project (WEDP) loans on the socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs. From the outcome of the study we can understand that women entrepreneurship development project (WEDP) loans have greater impact on the socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs.

In the study area, respondents from the treatment category were found to register an increased income for the last three years in comparison with control group. With respect to client's income improvement, participation in microfinance services definitely has a positive impact for lowincome earner clients.

Most of the clients intimated that their participation in the microfinance program has brought about an increase in income level, increase in savings, and increase in total expenditure. The impact in decision making of most of the clients has increased significantly since joining the program. The study also established that through the training and education the field officers offer to their clients before loan dispersed, helps them manage and run their businesses well. The leadership positions the female clients occupy in their various groups has helped build their leadership skills.

According to the women, they have seen tremendous improvement in their business skills, selfconfidence, and good relationship with others in the community as well as reduction in domestic violence against them. It is again revealed that, women feel very confident to make contributions during community meetings, group meetings and in their households, they have also seen a great improvement in their impact of decision making.

There are several attractive features associated with propensity score matching, including the potential to allow for heterogeneous impacts, while optimally weighting observed characteristics when constructing a comparison group. The technique is well suited due to its flexible (nonparametric) nature, not imposing exclusion restrictions or ad hoc assumptions about the functional form of impacts. The method eliminates selection bias due to observable differences between treatment and controls. Although a very limited data set was used, permitting to match on a wide range of household characteristics, the likelihood always remains of latent unobserved factors being correlated with microfinance participation and outcome variables.

In the study area, respondents were found to register an increased income for the last three years because of the loan obtained from WEDEP. With respect to income improvement, participation in microfinance services definitely has a positive impact for low-income earner clients.

Most of the clients intimated that their participation in the WEDP program has brought about an increase in income level, increase in savings, and increase in total expenditure. The impact in
decision making of most of the clients has increased significantly since joining the program. The study also established that through the training and education the field officers offer to their clients before loan dispersed, helps them manage and run their businesses well. The leadership positions the female clients occupy in their various groups has helped build their leadership skills.

According to the women, they have seen tremendous improvement in their business skills, selfconfidence, and good relationship with others in the community as well as activity in domestic violence against them. It is again revealed that, women feel very confident to make contributions during community meetings, group meetings and in their households, they have also seen a great improvement in their impact of decision making.

### 5.3 RECOMMENDATION

Following are recommendations derived from the study for the academia and Vision Fund Micro Finance Institution, Addis Ababa branch. Also included are my recommendations for further study in this area. Depending up on the findings of this study, the following recommendations are forwarded.

The WEDP should be encouraged to give loans to individuals who are not accepted at the group level due to low or no income generation or business activity apart from farming, to uphold the fundamental objective of the WEDEP. The WEDP should also provide microcredit to the poor who have good business plans to start up their own businesses thereby alleviating them from socioeconomic development of women entrepreneurs and not only target the productive poor. To fully achieve their impact of reaching out to the poorest, WEDP must move to the countryside where socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs is endemic in Ethiopia and elsewhere in the developing countries. They can still operate in some area in poor communities and be profitable since the clients are ready to pay whatever interest rate they charge them as they are being provided with a tailor-made products and services they need on a continuous basis.
Finally, sustainable development and socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs activity objectives can only be successful through the implementation of practical and sound development instruments and strategies. Provision of microfinance is one of the most essential instruments of tackling the problem of socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs and
under development. Therefore, such institutions should gain all necessary supports from the government, the public, funding institutions, and other development stakeholders. The government also can do more in reducing socio- economic development of women entrepreneurs by providing the rural areas with good infrastructure and social amenities to attract more microfinance activities to the extreme poor in those deprived areas. It is only through working together that we can tackle the challenges of development of women entrepreneurs in Ethiopia.

## 6. REFERENCE

Akeredolu-Ale, E.O. 1975.The Underdevelopment of indigenous entrepreneurship in Nigeri, Ibadan University Press.

Abiyot Urga Dadi. 2017. Impact of Gasha Micro Finance Institution S.Co in the Reduction of Poverty. St. Mary's University

Berna (1966) Industrial Entrepreneurs Madras State, Bombay Asia, publishing house 1966.

Bryman, A., \& Bell, E. (2003). Business researchmethods. 6thed. Oxford: Oxford University Press..

Cantillon, R. (1755) Essai sur la nature du commerce en general. London: Fetcher Gyler.
C. Natarajan and M. Kavitha, "Competencies of the Women Entrepreneurs", Third Concept, p.39.

Coughlin, J. H., \& Thomas, A. R. (2002). The rise of women entrepreneurs: People, processes, and global trends. Westsport: Greenwood Publishing Group.

Dhameja, S. K. (2002). Women Entrepreneurs: Opportunities, performance and problems. India: Deep and Deep Publications.

Drucker, P. F. (1964). The Big Power of Little Ideas. Harvard Business Review, 42(3), 6.

Eshetu Bekele \& Zeleke Worku, 2008. "Factors That Affect The LongTerm Survival Of Micro, Small And Medium Enterprises In Ethiopia," South African Journal of Economics, Economic Society of South Africa, vol. 76(3), pages 548-568.

Grafisk, S. 2000. the circumstances of women entrepreneurs; international surveys and research into female entrepreneurship, Agency for Trade and Industry Electronic edition, November.

Floro, S. 2001. Gender dimensions of the financing for development agenda: working paper prepared for development agenda nations development fund for women in preparation for the 2002 UN conference on financing for development (FD).

Hagen, E.E. 1962. On the theory of social change: how economic growth begins: Illinois. Dorsey Press, Homewood.

International Labor Organization (2007). Conclusions concerning the Promotion of Sustainable Enterprises

Kameshwar Jha 'Growth of Entrepreneurship in an Under Developed Region with special reference to Bihar State. an unpublished Ph.D. Thesis 1970.

Jalbert, S.E. (2000) Women Entrepreneurs in the global economy. (Web) http://www.cipe org/programs/women/pdf/jalbert.pdf.(Date of access: 24 October 2009)

Josiane, C. 1998. Gender issues in microenterprise development, ILO Publications, Geneva, June: http://www.ilo.org/enterprise.

Klapper, Leora F., and Simon C. Parker. 2011. Gender and the Business Environment for New Firm Creation. World Bank Research Observer, World Bank Group, vol. 26(2), pages 237-257.

Kantor, P. 1999. Promoting Women's entrepreneurship development based on good practice programs: some experiences form the North to South, (An ILO Working Paper on Series of Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender in Enterprises WEDGE Working) No. 9 .

Kjeldsen, J., Nielson, K. 2000. The circumstances of women entrepreneurs. Danish Agency for Trade and Industry, November: http://www.ebst.dk/publiser/reporter/women entrepreneurs/kap04.html
K. Lavanya Latha , "A study on service enterprises", The PRP Journal of Human Rights, Vol.10, No.2, April-June 2006, p. 35.

Knight, F.H. 1978.Risk, uncertainty and profit.Houghton, Mifflin, New York.

Kpohazounde, V. 1994.The role of women in agricultual research and extension. In: Agricultural extension in Africa. Proceedings of an International Workshop, Younde Cameroon.

Kirzner, I.M. 1999. Creativity and /or alertness: a reconsideration of the schumpeterian entrepreneur. Rev.Austrian Econ., Vol. 11.

Kothari, C. R. (2008). Research Methodology, Methods and Techniques (2nd ed., pp. 109-110). New Delhi: New Age Inter- national (P) Limited.

Kumar, R., Singh, R.D. and Sharma, K.D. (2005) Water Resources of India. Current Science, 89, 794-811.

Madhur Bala, Ph.D., Scholar, and Dr.O.OP. Manga, Associate Professor, Dept. of sociology, H.P. University, Shimla. An article entitled, "Socio Economic Status of working women: A study" published in Southern Economist, vol.46, No.7, August 1, 2007, p. 37.

Mayoux, 2001. Jobs, gender and small enterprises: getting the policy environment Righ: An ILO Working paper on series of Women's entrepreneurship development and gender in enterprises- WEDGE, NO. 15.

Minniti, M., Arenius, P. 2003. Women in entrepreneurship; the entrepreneurialadvantage of nations; First Annual Global Entrepreneurship Symposium; United Nations Publications, April.
M.Sumathy, Lecturer, and Mr.K.Negendran, Project fellow.Dept. of Commerce, Periyar University, Salem. An article entitled, women empowerment - Ethics and logics, published in Southern Economist, Vo. 46,No:6, July 15,2007, p.13.

Moore, D. 1990. An examination of present research on the female entrepreneur suggested research strategies for the 1990s. J. Business Ethics, 9: 275281.

Okafor, C. \&Mordi, C. (2010). Women Entrepreneurship Development in Nigeria: the effect [104] of Environmental factors. Economic Sciences Series, Vol. LxII No.4: 43-52.

Reynolds, P. D (2007) "Entrepreneurship in the United States", Springer, ISBN 978-0-387- [122] 45667-6

Reynolds, P. D (2007) "Entrepreneurship in the United States", Springer, ISBN 978-0-387- [122] 45667-6

Say, J.B.(1803).A Treatise on Political Economy, (3rd. US Edition). Philadelphia: John Grigg.

Saunders, M., Lewis, P. and Thornhill, A. (2009) Research Methods for Business Students. Pearson, New York.

Schumpeter, J.A. 1954. History of economic analysis. Allen \& Unwin, London.

Suganthi, J. (2009). Influence of motivational factors on women entrepreneurs in SMEs. Asia Pacific Business Review, 5(1), 95-104.

Surti, K and Sarupriya, D. Psychological factors effecting womenentrepreneurs: Some findings, Indian Journal of Social Work, 1984, 44(3),pp.287-295.

Thomson, S. 2002. Women's entrepreneurship development in micro and small enterprises, a case study in the

Timmons, J.A. 1978. Characteristics and role demands of entrepreneurship.Am. J. Small Business, 3: 517.

Udechukwu, I. 2004. Survey of small and medium scale industries and their potentials in Nigeria: CBN seminar on small and medium industries equity investments scheme, http/www.CBN/Org./2004/Maritime.

Ukraine; A paper presented to the school of international training, international studies, organizations, and social justice, Geneva, Switzerland, May, 6.

UNESCAP (2005).Developing Women Entrepreneurs in South Asia.Issues, Initiatives an Experiences.Trade and Investment Division, Bangkok, Thailand.

United Nation, 2006.Entrepreneurship and e-Business Development for Women. United Nations Pulicactions, United Nations Publication. Pp. 114.

Vesper, K.H. 1980. New venture strategies. Englewood Cliffs, Prentice Hall, Inc.

Wennekers, Thurik, 1999. Linking entrepreneurship and economic growth.Small Business Econ., 13(27).

Wiklund, J., Shepherd, D.A. 2005. Entrepreneurial small business: a resource-based perspective. Edward Elger Publishing,Chelternham.

World Bank. 2012. "World Development Report 2012: Gender Equality and Development." Washington, DC: World Bank.

World Bank. 2019. Enterprise Survey Ethiopia. Washington, DC: World Bank.
World Bank. 2019. Financing Women Entrepreneurs in Ethiopia: The Women Entrepreneurship Development Project (WEDP).

Yamane, Taro. (1967). Statistics: An Introductory Analysis, 2nd Edition, New York: Harper and Row.

Appendix- A 1



00me中













## 

G7NXI. P:-
-


1.1: \% ;

1. 1 $\square$
2. $\boldsymbol{n}$ - $\qquad$
1．2：\％

$\square$
2． 130 $\qquad$ $3.14 \square$

1．3：yeaysin1．$\grave{A C P R}$ $\square$ 3．$ク \uparrow \rightarrow \boldsymbol{n}$
入入－－－－－－－－－－
$\square$ 2．กลガロ $\square$


$\square$ •・フI
$\square$ PA7ף
$\square$ OF：7 PナAP
$\square$


1．5 Рキタロリム年 คくす

$\square$
 $\square$凡тパロワ
$\square$ व73กनी $\square$ व9\％
$\square$
 $\square$
 $\qquad$内み $\qquad$ $\boldsymbol{P} \boldsymbol{9 P} C------$

| ＋．中． | Pサへよん ก9ロ | 9\％ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |



1． $\operatorname{Ln} 7 \mathrm{n}$ ， $\square$ 3．Pロナกべ 7n $\square$
 $\square$
 $\square$


| ＋．¢． | P70，9036 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |


1． 93 ， 4 $\square$
 $\square$ 3．ณタロでオ $\qquad$

 $\square$
 $\square$

4． BA $\qquad$ $\square$




6．$\lambda \lambda$ $\qquad$

1．$\kappa \boldsymbol{P}$
2．ห．คคダ
 $\qquad$


ПनС вの入ө－ $\qquad$








n－nc $\qquad$

Пーロら $\qquad$


1．$\AA$ Р
2．К卫คスタロ
 $\qquad$

1．$\kappa \boldsymbol{P}$
2．PAgD


3．ก3नीくれ กัคб
2． $\boldsymbol{\text { R }}$ П



 $\qquad$
4．6．Ф．尺．т Иロロф入中
1．$\kappa \boldsymbol{P}$
2．PAgD
3．${ }^{\text {ond }}$ Pスgロ
 $\qquad$


1．$\kappa$ P
2．PスgD

1．кпゅ
 $\qquad$
 $\qquad$


 $\qquad$
 $\qquad$
 $\qquad$
 $\qquad$


1．ఓP 2．P入9D

1．Кกาァ官
2．6．中ค豆

3．U $\boldsymbol{U}$ が
4． $\boldsymbol{\lambda \lambda}$ $\qquad$

1．КP 2．P入9ロ

1．ћ中 $\boldsymbol{n}$ $\qquad$ 2．9内审年 $\qquad$ 3．คaษリก็ $\qquad$
 $\qquad$ 5．Д入 $\qquad$ ．

nनC： $\qquad$


3．h几＋


 $\qquad$




5．入ๆ下


8． $\boldsymbol{\lambda 1 0 4 ヶ 4 \% ~}$
9．$\Delta \lambda$ $\qquad$


1．กА न可
2．ワロゅ 2，H NA


4．नी巾 2，H
5．叫的市 न美
6．$\lambda \lambda$ $\qquad$

1．กd नी戸
2．नीt 2H nd



6．$\Delta \lambda$
$\qquad$

1．ワ才




6． $\boldsymbol{\lambda} \lambda$ $\qquad$

1．$\kappa$ Р
2．Кคคスタロ

1．玄
2． 3 Р劳
3．$d \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{\mathbf{\beta}}$

1．玄
2． $7 \boldsymbol{8}$ 究
3．$d \stackrel{\$}{5}$
7.7 Р


1．负
2． 7 Р莺
3．$d \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{\mathbf{\beta}}$

1．$\kappa$ Р
2．PAgD


2．ก


1．$\kappa$ Р
2．PAgD




1． $\boldsymbol{\kappa P} \quad$ 2． $\boldsymbol{\text { P } \boldsymbol { A g D }}$
 $\qquad$

8．夫力hび

1．$\kappa \boldsymbol{P}$
2．Рスgロ

1．$\kappa \boldsymbol{P}$
2．PAgD

1．$\kappa \boldsymbol{P}$
2．PAgD

1．$\kappa \boldsymbol{P}$
2．PAgD

1．$\kappa$ P
2．РАg

1．$\kappa \boldsymbol{P}$
2．PAgD

1．$\kappa \boldsymbol{P}$
2．PスgD

1．$\kappa \boldsymbol{P}$
2．PAgD

1．$\kappa$ P
2． $\mathbf{P} \boldsymbol{A g}{ }^{0}$

1．$\kappa$ P
2．PAgD


1．$\kappa$ 2．P $\boldsymbol{P}$ g

1．ЋP
2．PAgD

1．$\kappa \boldsymbol{P}$
2．PAgD



1．ஈヶ Ф入ค


5．৯入 $\qquad$
9.2 Р

1．h7nPar P3



$\qquad$
$\qquad$
9.5 Р
 $\qquad$


